

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

Manuscript NO: 74549

Title: Does chronic kidney disease affect the complications and prognosis of patients after primary colorectal cancer surgery? A meta-analysis.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05776275

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Research Associate

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-12-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-03 12:45

Reviewer performed review: 2022-01-09 16:31

Review time: 6 Days and 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

**Peer-reviewer
statements**

Peer-Review: ☒ Anonymous ☐ Onymous

Conflicts-of-Interest: ☐ Yes ☒ No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors should consider including outcomes from recent studies such as by Shaan Dudani et al 2021 :The Impact of Chronic Kidney Disease in Patients With Locally Advanced Rectal Cancer Treated With Neoadjuvant Chemoradiation

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

Manuscript NO: 74549

Title: Does chronic kidney disease affect the complications and prognosis of patients after primary colorectal cancer surgery? A meta-analysis.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05469232

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Chief Physician, Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-12-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-11 06:09

Reviewer performed review: 2022-01-22 13:27

Review time: 11 Days and 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

**Peer-reviewer
statements**

Peer-Review: [☒] Anonymous [☐] Onymous

Conflicts-of-Interest: [☐] Yes [☒] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a study for subjects for which prospective intervention studies are difficult, and I think this study is a very important study. I have some questions. 1. It is known that cardiovascular events such as myocardial infarction and cerebral infarction increases in dialysis patients. Is there any data of cardiovascular events? 2. Figure 4 shows that CKD patients have poorer OS. I think that CKD patients also have many non-cancer related deaths. Was there a distinction between cancer-related death and non-cancer-related death in each study? 3. Figure shows that CKD patients have poorer DFS. I think that adjuvant chemotherapy may be difficult for CKD patients. Did you have any data on adjuvant chemotherapy in each study? 4. This study analyzes low eGFR levels and hemodialysis patients together, but the presence or absence of dialysis may make a big difference among CKD patients. I think it is better not to do the same analysis for non-dialysis and dialysis cases with low eGFR levels.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

Manuscript NO: 74549

Title: Does chronic kidney disease affect the complications and prognosis of patients after primary colorectal cancer surgery? A meta-analysis.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 04163041

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FACS, MBBS, MNAMS

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-12-27

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-11 17:09

Reviewer performed review: 2022-01-26 03:23

Review time: 14 Days and 10 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input type="checkbox"/>] Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study hypothesis 1) CKD affects the post operative complications, is non controversial. The other hypothesis 2) CKD influences the prognosis of colorectal cancer has no published data and also the possible ways in which the oncological outcome of colorectal cancer can be influenced by CKD is not discussed. (There are only data to show that CKD may be associated with increased risk of Colon cancer). In this study only age, sex, ASA score, TNM staging and co morbidities are the parameters, that are used to assess the homogeneity between the groups. It is said that the CKD group had higher proportion of patients with colon cancer. This analysis is performed for colon and rectal cancer combined. Operable rectal cancer patients receive perioperative Chemo radiotherapy and no data is analyzed with reference to this, thus rendering homogeneity between these groups questionable. Difference in chemo radiotherapy schedule, completion of the schedule etc., between the groups may alter the prognosis. There is no data about the different surgical procedures, like elective, emergency, re surgery, R0 R1 surgery, between the two groups. Blood transfusion, a factor that influences the prognosis, may have been more in the CKD group. The follow up details are missing. Though the methodology used appears appropriate in this meta-analysis, not considering the other factors that may influence the long term outcome, render the results less valuable. In this meta analysis, 679 patients with colorectal cancer and CKD (not all have eGFR as stated) were compared with 44203 patients with Colorectal cancer. Comparing this two groups may give misleading information. Comment: Major revision required.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology*

Manuscript NO: 74549

Title: Does chronic kidney disease affect the complications and prognosis of patients after primary colorectal cancer surgery? A meta-analysis.

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 04163041

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FACS, MBBS, MNAMS

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2021-12-27

Reviewer chosen by: Han Zhang (Online Science Editor)

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-04-14 11:39

Reviewer performed review: 2022-04-15 01:56

Review time: 14 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Nil