

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 75094

Title: Spontaneous Bacterial Empyema in Cirrhosis - A Systematic Review and Incidence Rate Meta-Analysis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03024263

Position: Associate Editor

Academic degree: DSc, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Russia

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-21

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-22 04:48

Reviewer performed review: 2022-01-24 18:41

Review time: 2 Days and 13 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Anonymous [<input type="radio"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="radio"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Spontaneous bacterial empyema (SBE) is a rare but well-described complication of decompensated liver cirrhosis, and is distinguished as a primary infection of pre-existing hepatic hydrothorax in the absence of cardiopulmonary or pleural disease. The authors conducted a meta-analysis of eight studies to systematize our knowledge about this disease. As far as I know, this is indeed the first such study (last year the authors published it as an abstract in the American Journal of Gastroenterology [DOI: 10.14309/01.ajg.0000778412.05122.db]), but I have not discovered anything new for myself. The relationship between hepatic hydrothorax and ascites is well known [DOI: 10.4254/wjh.v9.i31.1197], and the main information regarding treatment and outcomes for patients with SBE are well described in the EASL Clinical Practice Guidelines [DOI: 10.1016/j.jhep.2018.03.024].

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 75094

Title: Spontaneous Bacterial Empyema in Cirrhosis - A Systematic Review and Incidence Rate Meta-Analysis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06151472

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: N/A

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-21

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-30 10:00

Reviewer performed review: 2022-01-30 11:20

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input type="checkbox"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This was a systematic review and metanalysis on spontaneous bacterial empyema in patients with cirrhosis. The Authors included 8 studies in their review, suggesting that the pooled incidence of SBE was 18%. The topic is of interest. On a general view, Discussion section is very long and contains some information that should be discussed in the Result section. Indeed, no descriptive info which are commonly seen in a systematic review has been provided in such section. My comments: 1. I suggest to include the latest EASL guidelines for the diagnosis of SBE. 2. In my opinion, the conclusions provided in the abstract section do not reflect the findings of this study, which do not address presence of prophylaxis for SBP, ESBL rates and so on. 3. I do not understand if case reports were included in the systematic review 4. 8999 patients were included; however, the sum of females and males does not match (110+270) 5. The significant heterogeneity across studies should be included among conclusions in the abstract section 6. The Authors said that one of the aims of this study was to assess the "incidence of SBP in all patients with cirrhosis". However, they considered only studies that assessed ascites in the setting of SBE. 7. Conclusions: in my opinion, thoracentesis in decompensated cirrhosis should be considered (also in patients without ascites) only after exclusion of other causes of pleural effusion (e.g., cardiac failure) and when there is a high suspicion of infection.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 75094

Title: Spontaneous Bacterial Empyema in Cirrhosis - A Systematic Review and Incidence Rate Meta-Analysis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05393105

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MBBS, MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-21

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-01-29 06:30

Reviewer performed review: 2022-02-04 13:17

Review time: 6 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A very nice systematic review The following suggestions are offered for improving the manuscript: 1. Please add the following articles in your discussion/analysis a. Matei D, Craciun R, Crisan D, Procopet B, Mocan T, Pasca S, Zaharie R, Popovici B, Sparchez Z. Hepatic Hydrothorax – An Independent Decompensating Event Associated with Long-Term Mortality in Patients with Cirrhosis. Journal of Clinical Medicine. 2021; 10(16):3688. <https://doi.org/10.3390/jcm10163688> b. Jiménez-Gutiérrez, JM, García-Juárez, I, Olivas-Martinez, A, Ruiz, I. One-year outcome of patients with cirrhosis who developed spontaneous bacterial empyema: A cohort study. J Dig Dis. 2021; 22(12): 714- 720. doi:10.1111/1751-2980.13066 c. Avula, Akshay MD; Acharya, Sudeep MD; Anwar, Shamsuddin MD; Narula, Naureen MD; Chalhoub, Michel MD; Maroun, Rabih MD; Thapa, Sakura MD; Friedman, Yelena MLIS Indwelling Pleural Catheter (IPC) for the Management of Hepatic Hydrothorax, Journal of Bronchology & Interventional Pulmonology: November 10, 2021 - Volume - Issue - doi: 10.1097/LBR.0000000000000823

2. Any data regarding the outcome of SBE? 3. Does the scope of the review include management options and their success?

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 75094

Title: Spontaneous Bacterial Empyema in Cirrhosis - A Systematic Review and Incidence Rate Meta-Analysis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03024263

Position: Associate Editor

Academic degree: DSc, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Russia

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-21

Reviewer chosen by: Li-Li Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-04-30 04:22

Reviewer performed review: 2022-04-30 04:29

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

No Comments

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 75094

Title: Spontaneous Bacterial Empyema in Cirrhosis - A Systematic Review and Incidence Rate Meta-Analysis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05393105

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MBBS, MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-21

Reviewer chosen by: Li-Li Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-04-30 12:19

Reviewer performed review: 2022-04-30 12:36

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

All queries addressed Reads better now

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Hepatology*

Manuscript NO: 75094

Title: Spontaneous Bacterial Empyema in Cirrhosis - A Systematic Review and Incidence Rate Meta-Analysis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06151472

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: N/A

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: United States

Manuscript submission date: 2022-01-21

Reviewer chosen by: Li-Li Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-04-30 15:20

Reviewer performed review: 2022-04-30 15:27

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

no further comments.