

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 75518

Title: Divergent Trajectories of Lean vs Obese Non-alcoholic steatohepatitis patients from Listing to Post-Transplant – A retrospective cohort study

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03509551

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: Canada

Manuscript submission date: 2022-02-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-02-03 08:04

Reviewer performed review: 2022-02-11 04:43

Review time: 7 Days and 20 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input type="checkbox"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written study that demonstrated that lean NASH has worse outcomes than obese NASH. Unfortunately, there is limited data on long term survival. Looks like obese NASH patients have higher incidence of cardiac disease than lean NASH patients. Would their long term patient survival thus be shorter than lean NASH due to cardiac events.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 75518

Title: Divergent Trajectories of Lean vs Obese Non-alcoholic steatohepatitis patients from Listing to Post-Transplant – A retrospective cohort study

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05445949

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Chief Physician, Research Associate

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Serbia

Author's Country/Territory: Canada

Manuscript submission date: 2022-02-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-02-27 12:06

Reviewer performed review: 2022-02-27 12:26

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

**Peer-reviewer
statements**Peer-Review: [☒] Anonymous [☐] OnymousConflicts-of-Interest: [☐] Yes [☒] No**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The authors retrospectively analyzed the role of BMI on outcomes of NASH cirrhosis transplants. The results of the study revealed paradoxical correlation of lean NASH with wait-list outcomes, and graft and patient survival post-liver transplantation. The study is very interesting and focus on the importance on healthy food and physical exercise before and after liver transplantation. The authors correctly described the limitations of the study, but some deeper insight of the mechanism linking lean NASH and better outcome of graft and patients is necessary.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 75518

Title: Divergent Trajectories of Lean vs Obese Non-alcoholic steatohepatitis patients from Listing to Post-Transplant – A retrospective cohort study

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05628603

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Canada

Manuscript submission date: 2022-02-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-02-27 00:28

Reviewer performed review: 2022-03-04 15:56

Review time: 5 Days and 15 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input type="checkbox"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No
-------------------------------------	---

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Retrospective studies are prone to be influenced by bias and enlarging the size sample or set comparison may be effective ways to avoid it. But i am sorry this manuscript dose not meet these requirements so the reliability of the conclusions remains elusive.