

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 78953

Title: Impact of BMI in elderly patients treated with laparoscopic liver resection for HCC

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05469410

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Research Scientist, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2022-07-24

Reviewer chosen by: Dong-Mei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-09-07 02:04

Reviewer performed review: 2022-09-08 10:00

Review time: 1 Day and 7 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors conducted a multi-center retrospective study to evaluate the short term and long term outcome on high BMI patients receiving laparoscopic liver resection (LLR). They divided patients into two groups based on BMI (BMI>30 or <30) and they found no significant difference for operation time and post-operative complication between two groups. And the patient survival of the two groups were also comparable. The study design is reasonable and the results seem to be solid. There are still some concerns as follow: 1 In this study, only a small number of patients received major hepatectomy, which I think is the reason leading to very good post-operative outcome in patients with high BMI. The authors should discuss and explain this. 2 The authors should show whether obesity affect liver function or histologic change in hepatocyte in their cohort. 3 The authors can discuss their experience of liver surgery for fatty liver, e.g., surgical technique, use of instrument, etc.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 78953

Title: Impact of BMI in elderly patients treated with laparoscopic liver resection for HCC

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03587704

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Chief Physician, Doctor, Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2022-07-24

Reviewer chosen by: Dong-Mei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-09-06 13:23

Reviewer performed review: 2022-09-15 07:29

Review time: 8 Days and 18 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors introduced their experience about the effect of BMI on the outcome of laparoscopic liver resection for HCC. According to the results of this multicenter retrospective research, the BMI did not impact perioperative and oncologic outcomes in elderly patients treated by laparoscopic resection for HCC. This result is somewhat incredible as it is well known that surgery for patients with higher BMI is more difficult, and usually the risk is higher than that with lower BMI. This conclusion is supported by their data. on the other hand, is there any special measures for the authors to decrease the difficulty and risk of laparoscopic liver surgery for relative obese patients. And I think it is very valuable if they have some experience about this issue.