

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 79061

Title: Short-term efficacy assessment of transarterial chemoembolization combined with radioactive iodine therapy in primary hepatocellular carcinoma

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06143450

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2022-11-01

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-11-06 10:23

Reviewer performed review: 2022-11-17 08:43

Review time: 10 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Judgment by peer reviewers	Does this manuscript meet the code of ethics standards? <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Does this manuscript have important novelty? <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Does this manuscript have important creativity or innovation?

	<input type="checkbox"/> [J31] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [J30] No Does this manuscript use reliable research methods? <input type="checkbox"/> [J41] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [J40] No Are the manuscript-accompanying data and figures authentic? <input type="checkbox"/> [J51] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [J50] No Does this manuscript make scientifically significant conclusions? <input type="checkbox"/> [J61] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [J60] No
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

TACE is the main treatment for patients with inoperable hepatocellular carcinoma. 125I radioactive implantation is a new means of radiotherapy with high radiation dose and precise localization, which provides new ideas for exploring the treatment on primary hepatocellular carcinoma. In this study, the authors investigated the short term clinical efficacy of TACE combined with radioactive ion implantation in the treatment of patients with primary liver carcinoma. This study is overall well designed and the manuscript is well written. The reviewer recommends to accept this manuscript after a minor editing to both the main text and the tables. Thank you.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 79061

Title: Short-term efficacy assessment of transarterial chemoembolization combined with radioactive iodine therapy in primary hepatocellular carcinoma

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05491991

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FRCPE, MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor, Research Associate

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2022-11-01

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-11-06 10:23

Reviewer performed review: 2022-11-17 08:43

Review time: 10 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Judgment by peer reviewers	Does this manuscript meet the code of ethics standards? <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Does this manuscript have important novelty? <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Does this manuscript have important creativity or innovation?

	<input type="checkbox"/> [J31] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [J30] No Does this manuscript use reliable research methods? <input type="checkbox"/> [J41] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [J40] No Are the manuscript-accompanying data and figures authentic? <input type="checkbox"/> [J51] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [J50] No Does this manuscript make scientifically significant conclusions? <input type="checkbox"/> [J61] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [J60] No
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, total 98 advanced primary liver cancer patients were included. The authors found that the TACE combined with radioactive iodine implantation in the treatment of advanced PLC can further inhibit the formation of blood vessels in tumor tissue and reduce the perfusion level of tumor lesions. The results of this study are interesting, and the well discussed. Minor comments: 1. There are some minor language polishing which should be corrected. 2. Primary hepatocellular carcinoma one type of primary liver cancer, please double check the abbreviation of PLC - primary liver cancer, not "Primary hepatocellular carcinoma". 3. Reference list should be edited and the references numbers in the main text should be double checked. I found there are some minor mistakes for this.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 79061

Title: Short-term efficacy assessment of transarterial chemoembolization combined with radioactive iodine therapy in primary hepatocellular carcinoma

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 06143355

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2022-11-01

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-11-06 10:23

Reviewer performed review: 2022-11-18 01:47

Review time: 11 Days and 15 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Judgment by peer reviewers	Does this manuscript meet the code of ethics standards? <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Does this manuscript have important novelty? <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Does this manuscript have important creativity or innovation?

	<input type="checkbox"/> [31] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [30] No Does this manuscript use reliable research methods? <input type="checkbox"/> [41] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [40] No Are the manuscript-accompanying data and figures authentic? <input type="checkbox"/> [51] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [50] No Does this manuscript make scientifically significant conclusions? <input type="checkbox"/> [61] Yes <input type="checkbox"/> [60] No
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall interesting study of TACE in primary liver cancer. After a minor revision, it can be accepted for publication. Minor comments: Please make clear if you are study on primary liver cancer or primary hepatocellular carcinoma. Although hepatocellular carcinoma is belonged to liver cancer, the authors should use a unified description in the title, abstract and main text.