

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

**Manuscript NO:** 79911

**Title:** Compound heterozygous mutations in PMFB Y cause acephalic spermatozoa syndrome: A case report

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 03208929

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-09-11

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-09-11 16:34

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-09-18 15:18

**Review time:** 6 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="radio"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="radio"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The title, abstract, key words and background expression are accurate and clear, the biostatistics, references, research methods and reports are reasonable, and the manuscripts are organized and presented in an orderly, concise and coherent manner. This study proposed new findings and new phenomena, but the manuscript did not describe the experimental method in sufficient detail and did not carry out experimental verification on the new findings. Two newly discovered heterozygous mutants: c414+1G>T (p.?) and c.393del (p.C132Afs \* 3) Will really affect the function of PMFBP1? The current results seem to have insufficient support for the conclusion, so the author is suggested to conduct further experimental verification. In terms of discussion, discussion on newly discovered heterozygous mutants should be added.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

**Manuscript NO:** 79911

**Title:** Compound heterozygous mutations in PMFB cause acephalic spermatozoa syndrome: A case report

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 04153245

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** BM BCh, MD, MSc, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Egypt

**Author's Country/Territory:** China

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-09-11

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-10-03 05:21

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-10-03 17:53

**Review time:** 12 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Anonymous [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Scientific language contains some errors. Please, re-check. Abstract: The mentioned conclusion is a recommendation & not a conclusion. Please, add it before recommendation. This phrase "To date, the following have" is to be corrected to "To date, the followings have ". History of past illness: It has been mentioned that the wife underwent an induced abortion. Please, clarify its cause for induction of abortion in this case. This phrase "and 200 sperm were counted" is to be corrected to "and 200 sperms were counted". This phrase "there were no normal sperm in the semen" s to be corrected to "there were no normal sperms in the semen". This word "progressivey" is wrong. Please, correct it. This "headless sperm tails" is wrong. Please, delete the word "tails". Add this reference to discussion that some authors attributed decreased rate of spermatogenesis in some cases of idiopathic infertility to high rates of apoptosis during normal spermatogenesis. Hegazy R, Hegazy A, Ammar M, Salem E. Immunohistochemical measurement and expression of Mcl-1 in infertile testes. *Frontiers of Medicine*. 2015 Sep;9(3):361-7.