

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 84593

Title: Stereotactic body radiotherapy combined with sintilimab in patients with recurrent or oligometastatic hepatocellular carcinoma: A phase II clinical trial

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03552361

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: France

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-26

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-03-27 07:51

Reviewer performed review: 2023-03-31 09:43

Review time: 4 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

this study reports the results of a non-comparative phase 2 trial of hcc treatment with SBRT and sintilimab. the results of PFS, OS and ORR are impressive. the authors suggest that this combination could become a new treatment option. several nuances could be added in the discussion: - almost all patients are carriers of viral hepatitis B, the conclusions of this work can therefore only concern patients with viral hepatitis B - the good results of stereotactic external radiotherapy at doses greater than 54 Gy should be mentioned in the discussion, as well as radio-embolization which regularly delivers doses to the tumor greater than 100 Gy - these excellent results must be confirmed in randomized studies versus stereotactic external radiotherapy without immunotherapy or versus radioembolization

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 84593

Title: Stereotactic body radiotherapy combined with sintilimab in patients with recurrent or oligometastatic hepatocellular carcinoma: A phase II clinical trial

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 04425299

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Lecturer, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-26

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-04-18 09:50

Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-18 15:20

Review time: 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, Thank you very much for submitting your work to the World Journal of Gastroenterology. This is a very well conducted trial on a novel combination of treatments for advanced HCC. Firstly, I think that the manuscript is overall very well written, with each section serving its purpose. Secondly, the methodology is robust for the objective of the trial, hence results are reliable and generalizable. Results are encouraging in the sense that they are highlighting the combination of Sintilimab and SBRT as a safe and very effective option. I think that overall the manuscript fulfils the stringent criteria for publication in the Journal and I recommend in favor of acceptance.