

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Stem Cells*

Manuscript NO: 84602

Title: Synergism of calycosin and bone-marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells to combat podocyte apoptosis to alleviate Adriamycin-induced focal segmental glomerulosclerosis

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05700519

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-29

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-03-29 05:00

Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-09 09:33

Review time: 11 Days and 4 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty

Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation
Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-designed study showing the positive effect of calycosin on the therapeutic efficacy of mesenchymal stem cells to alleviate Adriamycin-induced focal segmental glomerulosclerosis by inhibiting podocyte apoptosis. The findings in mice model and cultured cells have been validated with desired molecular techniques.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Stem Cells*

Manuscript NO: 84602

Title: Synergism of calycosin and bone-marrow-derived mesenchymal stem cells to combat podocyte apoptosis to alleviate Adriamycin-induced focal segmental glomerulosclerosis

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05246699

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MSc, PhD

Professional title: Academic Research, Chief Physician

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Iran

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-29

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-04-17 04:37

Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-19 06:30

Review time: 2 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty

Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation
Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have given a detailed description of the role of Calycosin pretreatment in enhances the therapeutic efficacy of mesenchymal stem cells to alleviate Adriamycin-induced focal segmental glomerulosclerosis by inhibiting podocyte apoptosis. However, there are many flaws and concerns on it. Study can be greatly improved if following suggestions were incorporated. 1. The title of the paper is not accurately expressed, and I think it needs to be rewritten. 2. Some references missing. For example, "As podocyte injury plays a critical role in FSGS progress, protecting podocytes is promising to prevent ESRD in patients with FSGS." and etc. 3. In the introduction section, Authors should, in addition to reviewing the results related to MSCs Studies on Focal Segmental GlomerulosClerosis, presented reviewing to the results of bone marrow-derived MSCs on Focal Segmental Glomerulosclerosis 4. In order to make the paper more interesting to read, I suggested that the authors could add one



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

graphical abstract to the manuscript. 5. I suggest including clear limitations of the study in the discussion.