

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 84872

Title: Historical changes in surgical strategy and complication management for hepatic cystic echinococcosis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05230210

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Egypt

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-04-09 03:55

Reviewer performed review: 2023-04-24 02:24

Review time: 14 Days and 22 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No

Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] Anonymous [<input type="checkbox"/>] Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="checkbox"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: · Needs language editing. · Also this seems more like minireview article type. Abstract: · Keywords: the words hepatic and cystic are not relevant, I suggest “hepatic cyst”, and “surgical excision”. · The word “hydatid disease” is never mentioned in the abstract or the manuscript, although this is the common name that most physicians and patients know the disease by, could the authors explain why? Introduction: · The introduction contains text repeated from the abstract, please modify. · There no mention of the single versus multiple or complicated cystic lesions incidence or the different approaches needed, pleas add. · The authors state “The present article reviews the surgical treatment strategy for hepatic CE and the historical evolution of postoperative complications.”>> did you mean the historical evolution of the surgical complications or the surgical techniques. Here the aim doesn’t match that of the abstract and doesn’t make sense. · There is no mention of any minimal invasive techniques which are used, please explain? Ref: Bayrak, M., Altıntas, Y. Current approaches in the surgical treatment of liver hydatid disease: single center experience. BMC Surg 19, 95 (2019). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12893-019-0553-1> Review: · The word “egg” is not appropriate to mention in hydatid · You mention “residual cavity infection” as the main complication, however seeding and secondary infection are very common and dangerous too, please elaborate. · Alpendazole is not for complicated infection, because it is mostly secondary bacterial infection as mentioned in most of the studies which needs antibiotics. Albendazole is usually used before the operation to avoid the spreading. · There is repetition in motioning the complications in each

technique although the complications of implantation, secondary infection, and spreading are universal to most surgical techniques; the writing needs modifications to avoid repetition. If the percentage of complications differ with different techniques I suggest presenting them in a table format for clear comparison. In the section titled “hepatectomy” please mention that this is “partial” and what parts are accessible (eg right lobe) and when is transplantation is needed eg if they are spreading to the whole liver as multiple complicated cysts?. Reference: Goja, S., Saha, S. K., Yadav, S. K., Tiwari, A., & Soin, A. S. (2018). Surgical approaches to hepatic hydatidosis ranging from partial cystectomy to liver transplantation. *Annals of hepato-biliary-pancreatic surgery*, 22(3), 208–215. <https://doi.org/10.14701/ahbps.2018.22.3.208> In local ablation no mentioning of local ablating therapies as ethanol. Even historically. Conclusion: There is no mentioning of any detailed imaging characteristics or techniques, yet it is mentioned in the conclusion, kindly add an elaborative part in the review. The conclusion is too long, please shorten. References: I suggest adding the previously mentioned references. Figures: there are no figures available to present the historical changes in the surgical techniques, I suggest adding them. Tables: please see the previous suggestion. Best regards, Sarah.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 84872

Title: Historical changes in surgical strategy and complication management for hepatic cystic echinococcosis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 00199533

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Chief Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Argentina

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-05-01 12:42

Reviewer performed review: 2023-05-07 03:23

Review time: 5 Days and 14 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The text is an interesting and dedicated journey through the history of surgery for cysts produced by echinococcosis. It is well founded and provides surgical information for decision-making about the treatment of the disease. Although it does not seem like a job that contributes new concepts, updating from a temporary perspective offers a necessary perspective for the incorporation of new techniques and procedures.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 84872

Title: Historical changes in surgical strategy and complication management for hepatic cystic echinococcosis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 02734287

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FEBS, MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Croatia

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-30

Reviewer chosen by: Geng-Long Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-05-02 19:22

Reviewer performed review: 2023-05-09 08:36

Review time: 6 Days and 13 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article provides a comprehensive review of surgical techniques in the treatment of cystic echinococcosis. The quality of English should be improved and the publication of the paper requires editing by a professional editor.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery*

Manuscript NO: 84872

Title: Historical changes in surgical strategy and complication management for hepatic cystic echinococcosis

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05230210

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Egypt

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-03-30

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-05-18 07:39

Reviewer performed review: 2023-05-23 12:42

Review time: 5 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I would like to thank the authors for the modifications. I recommend using highlighting text or track changes so it would be easier to review the changes made.