

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

**Manuscript NO:** 86436

**Title:** FECAL TRANSPLANTATION IN PATIENT WITH METASTATIC MELANOMA  
REFRACTORY TO IMMUNOTHERAPY: A CASE REPORT.

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 06303455

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Research Scientist, Research Assistant, Research Associate

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Iran

**Author's Country/Territory:** Brazil

**Manuscript submission date:** 2023-06-18

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2023-06-23 02:15

**Reviewer performed review:** 2023-06-23 19:00

**Review time:** 16 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

<b>Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In reference to the manuscript entitled "FECAL TRANSPLANTATION IN PATIENT WITH METASTATIC MELANOMA REFRACTORY TO IMMUNOTHERAPY: A CASE REPORT", the manuscript presents reversal of a melanoma patient's sensitivity to Pembrolizumab; however, no immunological assessments have been taken into consideration and the assumptions are mainly based on the clinical response achieved! Numerous points need to be addressed before any further consideration! Please revise in a point-by-point manner with the track changes. By what mechanics can FMT restore sensitivity to Pembrolizumab? Please discuss the underlying mechanism with clinical references! The text of the manuscript must be carefully and thoroughly revised by a native speaker. Please avoid referring to the patient as him/he! What clinically happened to the patient the treatment was Ipilimumab plus Pembrolizumab? What was the reason for taking FMT into consideration? Is there a clear procedure? Were the pathological characteristics of the two patients' disease similar? Please include the data related to this! Also, the characteristics of the two patients alongside their prior lines of therapy must be included! Was complete remission declared at last? Please

declare the status of the patient as of 23 June, 2023! Most sentences in the discussion section do not have any references to back them up. Please revise and add! Please expand the discussion on previous studies that have used FMT to reverse resistance to immunotherapy! Only two studies have been discussed which must be more! Please discuss the shortcomings of the study and how they could influence the whole trajectory! Please define all abbreviations of the figure captions.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

**Manuscript NO:** 86436

**Title:** FECAL TRANSPLANTATION IN PATIENT WITH METASTATIC MELANOMA  
REFRACTORY TO IMMUNOTHERAPY: A CASE REPORT.

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 06286468

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Brazil

**Manuscript submission date:** 2023-06-18

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2023-06-19 03:09

**Reviewer performed review:** 2023-06-26 09:17

**Review time:** 7 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

<b>Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

More work about the mechanism of Fecal Microbiota Transplantation treating immune-refractory patients with metastatic melanoma is suggested to added in the discussion section. I wonder if the “Non-Native Speakers of English Editing Certificate” the authors submitted is OK?

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

**Manuscript NO:** 86436

**Title:** FECAL TRANSPLANTATION IN PATIENT WITH METASTATIC MELANOMA  
REFRACTORY TO IMMUNOTHERAPY: A CASE REPORT.

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 06303455

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Research Scientist, Research Assistant, Research Associate

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Iran

**Author's Country/Territory:** Brazil

**Manuscript submission date:** 2023-06-18

**Reviewer chosen by:** Ji-Hong Liu

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2023-07-05 05:17

**Reviewer performed review:** 2023-07-05 06:16

**Review time:** 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Dear authors, Special thanks for addressing the raised concerns; however, the responses to the comments are not in a point-by-point manner (instead of responding "done" or "we did that" include the full response in the section below each comment. Also, the changes in the text of the manuscript are not visible. Please highlight them or revise with track changes. Please revise and re-submit!