

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Clinical Cases*

Manuscript NO: 88816

Title: Mental health implications of suicide rates in South Africa

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05449319

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Saudi Arabia

Author's Country/Territory: South Africa

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-10

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-10-17 06:38

Reviewer performed review: 2023-10-22 09:51

Review time: 5 Days and 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors, I reviewed your narrative review entitled "Mental Health Implications of Suicide Rates in South Africa". I have some comments: - Introduction: Research on suicidal behaviour indicates that males are four times more likely to commit suicide than females, but that women are more likely to have suicidal thoughts. Give reference for this statement. - Mental health in South Africa (SA): This is as a result of the country's alarmingly high rates of crime and violence which leads to suicidal thoughts and suicide hence the need mental health interventions [12, 13]. Either use "of" or "for" after the word "need". - Mental health policy and state of mental health care in SA: The adoption of the Mental Health Policy Framework (MHPF) for SA and the Strategic Plan 2013 – 2020 in July 2013 by the National Health Council followed series of consultations including provincial and national mental health summits between February and April 2012 and this is the first national mental health policy guidelines for a democratic South Africa, the “National health policy guidelines for improved mental health in South Africa”, drafted in 1997, set a progressive agenda. Consider splitting this sentence. Its too long. - Recent studies indicated that despite the formal adoption of the overarching



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

National CAMH policy, none of the nine provinces had a current CAMH policy or plan [21]. This study [21] was published in 2018 (5 years ago), is it recent? Provide abbreviation for CAMH. - Mental health policy implementation has not been effective due to lack of adequate attention, limited staff for policy and planning and neglect of responsibilities by some provincial authorities for driving implementation [27], psychiatric hospitals are outdated, shortages of mental health professionals, community mental health and psychosocial rehabilitation services are still undeveloped, there is no specific budget for mental health either at national or provincial level and therefore mental health services are funded out of general health budgets which make them inefficient and not functional [22, 28]. This sentence is too lengthy. Modify it. - The South African human rights commission's report of the status of mental health care in South Africa clearly stated You already mentioned that it is South African human rights commission's report. So need to mention again "in South Africa". - Suicide in South Africa: Suicide rate for females in South Africa is 4.5 per 100 000, with twice as many women reporting suicide attempts as men [25]. A study [31] on Trends in Suicide Mortality in South Africa reported a male predominance in suicide rates that is consistent with previous findings in South Africa. First sentence implies that female suicidal rate is higher. Next sentence projects that there is male predominance. Which one is correct? - A recent study conducted in 2020 did not observe an overall decline in suicide mortality despite high rate of decline in suicide rate in other parts of the world [31]. Only studies published in 2022 or 2023 is recent. - On average 9.5% of non-natural deaths... Modify to "On an average, 9.5% of" - Youth social stress was significantly associated with the suicide Attempt in a [5]. The sentence is incomplete. - Some regional suicide prevention initiatives exist which include the following the South African Depression and Anxiety Remove "the following". -]. It was discovered that however that no national prevention programme exists in South

Africa. Significant progress is yet to be made in planning Use of word “that” - once is enough. - Observations based on Literature Analyses: What was the inclusion and exclusion criteria of your study?