



### PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Methodology*

**Manuscript NO:** 89196

**Title:** Update on the gut microbiome in health and diseases

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05491748

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2023-10-23

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ru Fan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2023-11-20 00:32

**Reviewer performed review:** 2023-11-20 03:15

**Review time:** 2 Hours

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <b>Scientific quality</b>                          | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish |
| <b>Novelty of this manuscript</b>                  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty   |
| <b>Creativity or innovation of this manuscript</b> | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation                                |



|   |  |
|---|--|
| <b>Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript</b> | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance   |
| <b>Language quality</b>   | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection |
| <b>Conclusion</b>   | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)<br><input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection          |
| <b>Re-review</b>  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No  |
| <b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>                                     | Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous  |
|   | Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No   |

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Dear Authors, As an editorial, the authors ought to discuss an important issue in this field with the aim of provoking substantive consideration throughout the field that will translate into a sustainable movement forward in its perspectives and practices. However, the current editorial draft is too broad and general and may not present a powerful argument on research directions and future prospects within the field of the gut microbiome in health and diseases. Several editorials and review papers have previously been published on these similar subjects (e.g. Afzaal M, Saeed F, Shah YA, Hussain M, Rabail R, Socol CT, Hassoun A, Pateiro M, Lorenzo JM, Rusu AV and Aadil RM (2022) Human gut microbiota in health and disease: Unveiling the relationship. *Front. Microbiol.* 13:999001. doi: 10.3389/fmicb.2022.999001; Wang, L., Wang, S., Zhang, Q. et al. The role of the gut microbiota in health and cardiovascular diseases. *Mol Biomed* 3, 30 (2022). doi.org/10.1186/s43556-022-00091-2; Gao Y, Li D, Liu YX. Microbiome research outlook: past, present, and future. *Protein Cell.* 2023;pwad031. doi:10.1093/procel/pwad031). In addition, some important academic terminologies were wrongly presented, for example, GPR 41 and 43 receptors, not GPCR 41.



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Methodology*

**Manuscript NO:** 89196

**Title:** Update on the gut microbiome in health and diseases

**Provenance and peer review:** Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer’s code:** 00068182

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Doctor, Professor, Surgeon

**Reviewer’s Country/Territory:** China

**Author’s Country/Territory:** Italy

**Manuscript submission date:** 2023-10-23

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ru Fan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2023-11-26 12:09

**Reviewer performed review:** 2023-11-26 12:55

**Review time:** 1 Hour

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <b>Scientific quality</b>                          | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish |
| <b>Novelty of this manuscript</b>                  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty   |
| <b>Creativity or innovation of this manuscript</b> | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair<br><input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation                                |



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** office@baishideng.com  
**https://www.wjgnet.com**

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <b>Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript</b> | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance   |
| <b>Language quality</b>   | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection |
| <b>Conclusion</b>   | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority)<br><input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection          |
| <b>Re-review</b>  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No  |
| <b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>                                     | Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous  |
|   | Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No   |

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

As a review, it is written broadly and is not very focused on a few issues. In addition, references and articles are poorly interconnected.