

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA **Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568 **E-mail:** office@baishideng.com https://www.wjgnet.com

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Clinical Cases

Manuscript NO: 89281

Title: The correlative factors of poor prognosis and abnormal cellular immune function

in patients with Alzheimer's disease

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05153399

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MSc, PhD

Professional title: Professor, Research Scientist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Mexico

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-26

Reviewer chosen by: Yu-Lu Chen

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-12-12 13:04

Reviewer performed review: 2023-12-13 19:16

**Review time:** 1 Day and 6 Hours

	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C:
Scientific quality	Good
	[ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Good [ Y] Grade C: Fair
this manuscript	[ ] Grade D: No creativity or innovation



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA **Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568 **E-mail:** office@baishideng.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ Y] Grade B: Good [ ] Grade C: Fair [ ] Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection
Re-review	[Y] Yes [] No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [ ] Anonymous [ Y] Onymous  Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [ Y] No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The presented article from Bai et al presents interesting findings associating lymphocyte subsets and MRI to prognosis in Alzhaimers disease, nevertheles serveral aspects should be addresed before this manuscript could be considered for publication. 1.- Introduction is quite general regarding describing the findings in lymphocyte subsets from previous research works where this aspect has been analyzed in a deeper way. Some works should be included to enrich the introductory section. Fohner AE, Sitlani CM, Buzkova P, Doyle MF, Liu X, Bis JC, Fitzpatrick A, Heckbert SR, Huber SA, Kuller L, Longstreth WT, Feinstein MJ, Freiberg M, Olson NC, Seshadri S, Lopez O, Odden MC, Tracy RP, Psaty BM, Delaney JA, Floyd JS. Association of Peripheral Lymphocyte Subsets with Cognitive Decline and Dementia: The Cardiovascular Health Study. J Alzheimers Dis. 2022;88(1):7-15. doi: 10.3233/JAD-220091. PMID: 35527553; PMCID: PMC9277688. Speciale L, Calabrese E, Saresella M, Tinelli C, Mariani C, Sanvito L, Longhi R, Ferrante P. Lymphocyte subset patterns and cytokine production in Alzheimer's disease patients. Neurobiol Aging. 2007 Aug;28(8):1163-9. doi: 10.1016/j.neurobiolaging.2006.05.020. Epub 2006 Jun 30. PMID: 16814429. 2.- Method section should be greatly improved:



7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA **Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: office@baishideng.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

Describing detailed the process for T, B and NK staining, adquisition, and reagents used. Representative image of the flow cytometry analysis should be included. Regarding, this point, since this is a retrospective study i wonder why lymphocyte subsets was performed to dementia patients, did these patients presented another inflamatory, or immunological concomitant disease? In the other hand, analysis must be improved by comparing groups acording to main general characteristics such as Alzheimer vs other dementia and acording to the HIS or MMSE scale. 3.- Results. The results section also must be improved greatly. I strongly suggest: a) representing the results in graphs when possible besides the tables, b) Including representative images for MRI and Flow citometry counts. Clarify the units in wich Lymphocytes subsets is represente, and how calculus were made, (especify proportion from full blood sample, from leucocytes, or lymphocytes?) Also verify or explain detailed the concordance between text and tables numbers since the text metions 55% but table its expressed as 0.55 T cell. Iclude the ROC for T cell count. 5.- Finally, adapt the discussion acording to the new finds this new analysis could provide to the manuscrip. Include references for discussing Th subsets such as Th 17 and T regulatory cells.