

March 29, 2014

Dear Editor,

Please find enclosed the edited manuscript in Word format (file name: 9598-review.doc).

**Title:** Peripheral primitive neuroectodermal tumor (PNET) of the kidney presenting with pulmonary tumor embolism

**Author:** Sathya Chinnaa, CJ Das, S Sharma, P Singh, A Seth, S Purkait, S R Mathur

Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology

**ESPS Manuscript NO: 9598**

The manuscript has been improved according to the suggestions of reviewers:

Our itemized response to reviewer's comments is as follows:

**Reviewer 1:**

The manuscript describes a very interesting presentation of a rare tumor. Also, the images provided nicely correlate with the clinical presentation. The main limitation of the manuscript currently is the poor syntax of the main text. Currently, I would not recommend for publication until the format and syntax of the manuscript improves considerably. With that being said, the case is very interesting and should be published. Please refer to the attached document for corrections/suggestions.

**Response:** Thank you very much! All the changes suggested in the track change of the word file have been incorporated to enhance the manuscript.

**Reviewer 2:**

The following sentence "Ultrasound abdomen showed a heteroechoic right renal mass with right renal vein thrombus" needs correction as follows: Abdominal Ultrasound showed a heterogeneous right renal mass and right renal vein thrombus.

**Response:** Changes made accordingly

The fig. 1A is not a nephrographic phase...it is an early (arterial phase) of corticomedullary differentiation (as it is correctly stated in the figure legend).

**Response:** Changes made accordingly

Discussion - The following statement is not correct: "The corticomedullary phase while not as good for tumor detection, serves to assess the retroperitoneum for direct spread to the renal vein, IVC" . The corticomedullary phase is in fact an arterial phase, and opacification of the veins is not achieved so as to estimate possible filling defects-thrombus.

**Response:** The statement is corrected accordingly

The authors should also discuss on the two previously published case reports and emphasize the similarities or differences.

**Response:** The previously published two case reports have been added in the discussion.

It would also be important to discuss on the differential diagnosis by imaging between plain thrombus and neoplastic thrombus.

**Response:** The same has been discussed.

Thank you again for considering our manuscript in the *World Journal of Radiology*.

Sincerely yours,

Chandan J Das. MD, DNB, MNAMS

Department of Radiology

All India Institute of Medical Sciences

NewDelhi, India

Fax: +91-11-2658663

E-mail: dascj@yahoo.com