

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11601

Title: Bacterial dysbiosis and inflammation persist following minor intestinal surgery.

Reviewer code: 00069297

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-05-28 21:15

Date reviewed: 2014-07-10 00:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The gut microbiota is essential to human health, yet the acquisition of this microbial community during infancy remains poorly understood. In this study, they used 454-pyrosequencing technology to assess the impact of minor abdominal surgery on the colonic microbial population in a juvenile pig model of intestinal transection surgery. They also performed a multi-site assessment of molecular alterations in key gut inflammatory markers to assess if surgery-related microbial dysbiosis was associated with intestinal inflammation at two weeks following surgery. This is the first study examining minor surgery-associated changes in the gut microbiome and inflammation and provides new insights into potential long-term consequences of abdominal surgery in infancy. This is a well-conducted and well written study. The experiments are described in detail, the results are shown nicely and the figures are impressive.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 11601

Title: Bacterial dysbiosis and inflammation persist following minor intestinal surgery.

Reviewer code: 00039316

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-05-28 21:15

Date reviewed: 2014-07-16 21:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I reviewed with great interest the study entitled "Bacterial dysbiosis and inflammation persist following minor intestinal surgery" that detected the effects of minor small-bowel surgery to large bowel microbiota and intestinal cytokines expression. The major issue of the study is that the authors bypass their major finding, namely the unchanged microbiota diversity following surgery. It is well known that microbiota diversity confers to the gut health and it is much more important than the relative changes among the families and genera. Therefore, I disagree with the study title and the study conclusions since the major study finding is neither acknowledged nor discussed. I recommend the change of the study title as "changes in the colon microbiota and intestinal cytokines genes expression following minimal intestinal surgery" and I expect that the authors will highlight and discuss the major study finding in the revised version of the manuscript. It is also difficult to understand the mechanism by which the altered microbiota leads to altered cytokines genes expression. More over, it is much more difficult to understand why there was a different pattern of altered cytokines genes expression in the different studied gut segments, as clearly illustrated in figure 1. Authors have not studied the small bowel microbiota alterations after surgery. However, these changes might be much more important since the small intestine is the largest immunological organ. Different microbiota alteration in the relative gut segments might be responsible for the observed cytokines genes expression discrepancies. Minor issues: 1. Abstract must be shortened to the number of words indicated in the authors guidelines, 2. Introduction should be shortened by one



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

third. 3. Discussion is also too long 4. The study primers must be presented in a formal table within the study