

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17359

Title: The brain-gut-microbiota axis in Parkinson's disease

Reviewer's code: 03290373

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-03-04 19:19

Date reviewed: 2015-03-27 03:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a very well wrote review in a new field of Knowledge. I have few points to address. 1)A couple of paragraphs about the possibilities fecal microbiota transplantation may enrich the discussion; 2)The is no doubt that brain-gut-microbiota axis interaction has a important role in the genesis of the disease, but It may be clear in the article and conclusion, that we do not exactly know what is the best probiotic or prebiotic, the better diet, or how to choose the appropriate donor for a microbiota transplantation.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 17359

Title: The brain-gut-microbiota axis in Parkinson's disease

Reviewer's code: 03317125

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-03-04 19:19

Date reviewed: 2015-04-30 16:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting topic and gives a novel view for the pathogenesis of PD, but I have several points to refer: 1. In Page 3, the author state "the dysregulation may also significantly contribute to the pathogenesis of PD itself, supporting the hypothesis that the pathological process is spread from the gut to the brain[1]". Indeed, the reference did not mention the brain pathological lesion may origin from gut, the author may check it carefully. 2. To my knowledge, symptoms of lower GI tract were accompanied more frequently with PD, but it is said most enteric neurons were distributed in upper GI tract, how to explain this phenomenon? 3. As microbiota is associated with the pathogenesis of PD, advances of probiotics, prebiotics and fecal microbiota transplantation applied to PD therapy may be described in detail.