



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25943

**Title:** Herbal medicines and nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

**Reviewer's code:** 00068215

**Reviewer's country:** Romania

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-26 22:49

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-19 02:05

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection          |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            |   | [ Y ] No                                       | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|   |   | BPG Search:                                    |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|   |   | [ Y ] No                                       |  |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I do not recommend the manuscript for publication because is not well structured article



# BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25943

**Title:** Herbal medicines and nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

**Reviewer's code:** 01490291

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-26 22:49

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-21 17:39

| CLASSIFICATION   | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|--|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing     | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor                 |  | [ Y ] No                                       | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|  |  | BPG Search:                                    |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|  |  | [ Y ] No                                       |  |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a comprehensive review of experiences regarding the use of chinese medicine in the treatment of NAFLD I suggest to review the conclusions with regard to the following considerations 1- the spectrum of NAFLD is not only not "primarily a condition of over nutrition" 2- the level of evidence of effectiveness achieved by the reported studies is different from traditional herbs, raw and natural product extracts. therefore the general conclusion stated by Authors cannot be shared.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25943

**Title:** Herbal medicines and nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

**Reviewer's code:** 00058390

**Reviewer's country:** Belgium

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-26 22:49

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-21 18:03

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
|   |   | BPG Search:                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|   |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

On the practical side, however, the review is a bit less useful, because the question remains " what could a medical doctor do and when?" Specifically, in NAFLD there are different disease stages: what to do in the case of steatosis, inflammation, fibrosis, cirrhosis and cancer? The manuscript does not provide practical information on when, how and with what to treat patients in these different developmental stages of NAFLD. For non-Chinese medical professionals it might also be difficult to obtain and use these medicines. For Chinese professionals those aspects might be different. Additional remarks: are these different medicines selected, and if yes on what basis? The authors state that "Traditional Chinese medicines are worthy of further study. (This review only summarizes a drop in the bucket, and) there will be more Chinese medicines for the treatment of NAFLD in the future." To the reviewer it is not exactly clear how treatment with herbal medicines is yet curing or helping patients with NAFLD in a practical way, so a future perspective seems to be quite volatile.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 25943

**Title:** Herbal medicines and nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

**Reviewer's code:** 00199528

**Reviewer's country:** Turkey

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-03-26 22:49

**Date reviewed:** 2016-04-22 10:58

| CLASSIFICATION                              | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|---|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good      | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair      | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor      |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|   |  | BPG Search:                                    |  |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|   |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No                    |  |

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

authors summarized chines herbal medicine having potential for NAFLD treatment and their mechanism of action on pathogenesis. my comments are as follow: Comments: ? "NAFLD...., which is the second leading cause of death in general population [6,7]." Sentence does not match with the references!!! ? The title of Figure1 is "...pathogenetic mechanism-based NAFLD", it should not be cited within a sentence referring NAFLD as a component of metabolic syndrome. ? Section "Underlying mechanisms of herbal medicines against NAFLD" should be placed before section "Traditional Chinese herbal formula".