

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25943

Title: Herbal medicines and nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00068215

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-03-26 22:49

Date reviewed: 2016-04-19 02:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	GoogleSearch:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I do not recommend the manuscript for publication because is not well structured article

Response: Thanks a lot for your review of our article. Although, you did not recognize our review paper, we still hope that this revised article will get your favor. In this review, we introduced some herbal medicines that have been proved to be effective in treating NAFLD through adjusting different mechanisms or molecular targets. NAFLD is essentially a condition of over nutrition. However, there is a current lack of effective therapies. Therefore, there is a great need to identify dietary approaches for NAFLD prevention and treatment. Though most results based on experimental studies need to be confirmed by further clinical trials, and the findings from clinical trials also need to get more morphological evidence, thus we still think that traditional Chinese medicines are promising and beneficial for the prevention and treatment of NAFLD in the future in world.



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25943

Title: Herbal medicines and nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 01490291

Reviewer's country:Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-03-26 22:49

Date reviewed:2016-04-21 17:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	GoogleSearch:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a comprehensive review of experiences regarding the use of chinese medicine in the treatment of NAFLD I suggest to review the conclusions with regard to the following considerations 1- the spectrum of NAFLD is not only not "primarily a condition of over nutrition" 2- the level of evidence of effectiveness achieved by the reported studies is different from traditional herbs, raw and natural product extracts. therefore the general conclusion stated by Authors cannot be shared.

Response: Thanks a lot for giving us the valuable advice. As you mentioned, we found that the conclusions are not enough depth and thorough. Based on your suggestion, we have re-written the conclusions, and this manuscript has also been thoroughly edited by a native English speaker from an editing company.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25943

Title: Herbal medicines and nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00058390

Reviewer's country: Belgium

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-03-26 22:49

Date reviewed: 2016-04-21 18:03

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	GoogleSearch:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

On the practical side, however, the review is a bit less useful, because the question remains " what could a medical doctor do and when?" Specifically, in NAFLD there are different disease stages: what to do in the case of steatosis, inflammation, fibrosis, cirrhosis and cancer? The manuscript does not provide practical information on when, how and with what to treat patients in these different developmental stages of NAFLD. For non-Chinese medical professionals it might also be difficult to obtain and use these medicines. For Chinese professionals those aspects might be different. Additional remarks: are these different medicines selected, and if yes on what basis? The authors state that "Traditional Chinese medicines are worthy of further study. (This review only summarizes a drop in the bucket, and) there will be more Chinese medicines for the treatment of NAFLD in the future." To the reviewer it is not exactly clear how treatment with herbal medicines is yet curing or helping patients with NAFLD in a practical way, so a future perspective seems to be quite volatile.

Response: Thanks a lot for the precious advice. We are very happy and thank you for your recognition of us. As you mentioned "On the practical side, however, the review is a bit less useful".



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

As NAFLD is essentially a condition of overnutrition, and there is a current lack of effective therapies. In addition, there is a great need to identify dietary approaches for NAFLD prevention and treatment. Traditional Chinese medicines (TCMs) are rich sources of biologically active substances and have desirable health benefits on prevention of human diseases. Some active compounds from medicinal plants have been used as the potential agents against NAFLD. But to date results from clinical studies are limited and often shown a subtle effect in comparison with animal models. Further research in rodents and human subjects using dietary achievable doses of TCMs or select combinations are needed. Concerning all the details mentioned above, there is real reason to believe that Chinese medicines will certainly play a remarkable role in the future to treat NAFLD.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 25943

Title: Herbal medicines and nonalcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00199528

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-03-26 22:49

Date reviewed: 2016-04-22 10:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	GoogleSearch:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

authors summarized chines herbal medicine having potential for NAFLD treatment and their mechanism of action on pathogenesis.my comments are as follow:Comments:? "NAFLD...., which is the second leading cause of death in general population [6,7]." Sentence does not match with the references!!!? The title of Figure1 is "...pathogenetic mechanism-based NAFLD", it should not be cited within a sentence referring NAFLD as a component of metabolic syndrome.? Section "Underlying mechanisms of herbal medicines against NAFLD" should be placed before section "Traditional Chinese herbal formula".

Response: Thanks a lot for giving us the valuable advice. We are sorry to make mistakes in references [6,7], and we have corrected the references. According to what you have mentioned, we have renamed Figure 1 and also placed Section "Underlying mechanisms of herbal medicines against NAFLD" before section "Traditional Chinese herbal formula". Furthermore, this manuscript has been thoroughly edited by a native English speaker from an editing company.