

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9652

Title: Early termination of immune tolerance state of HBV infection may explain early liver damage in Bangladesh

Reviewer code: 02445074

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-02-22 20:49

Date reviewed: 2014-03-28 03:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GENERAL COMMENTS: This is an interesting study. The authors might well state more strongly that their study supports the approach, if possible, of treating young chronic carriers who might superficially appear symptom-free. The English usage is good but still should be polished somewhat. Only some examples are shown below. **SPECIFIC COMMENTS:** 1. Abstract This should be written without the use of the first person. 2. 3 Change to: Maybe 2 billion people have been infected with hepatitis ... 3. 4 carriers in Bangladesh 4. 4 in other countries 5. 6 100-pd !!! 6. 7 mean \pm standard deviation (here and elsewhere including Table: spaces on either side of \pm) 7. 8 and 21 were 8. 8 100,000 not 100000 (here and elsewhere) 9. 17 and that in

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9652

Title: Early termination of immune tolerance state of HBV infection may explain early liver damage in Bangladesh

Reviewer code: 00012513

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-02-22 20:49

Date reviewed: 2014-03-28 13:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study of Mamun -Al- Mahtab et al raises an interesting issue about the state of immuno tolerance of HBV infection in young individuals in your geographic area , reporting that 53 % of the study population are HBeAg negatives and a randomly selected group of only 8 of these cases do not present the most frequent precore mutation elsewhere in the world. The study has many methodological and drafting limitations. Draws particular attention at methodological level, due that it is detailed the PCR reaction performance (volumes, times, temperatures), nonessential thing since this technique is firmly established, while not details about primers or HBV fragment are included. In addition no data about how precore variants are analyzed (sequencing?) are included. There is no indication that genomic variants are considered in the precore or in other regions as the basic core promoter etc ... Nor is it easy to justify because only 8 patients analyzed a group of 89 HBeAg negatives. La documentation of results is clearly insufficient and the discussion does not include any odds explanation or speculation on the phenomenon of loss of tolerance.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Hepatology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 9652

Title: Early termination of immune tolerance state of HBV infection may explain early liver damage in Bangladesh

Reviewer code: 02446172

Science editor: Xiu-Xia Song

Date sent for review: 2014-02-22 20:49

Date reviewed: 2014-03-28 16:42

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Although inadequate number of patients, it is an interesting article in terms of having insight on regional data. The article should be reviewed for language. Number of patients should be rechecked: One hundred sixty seven treatment naive young chronic HBV-infected patients, aged between 12 to 20 years (17.5 ± 2.8 year, $N=161$) were enrolled in this study.