

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 27631

Title: Mesenchymal stem cell therapy in retinal and optic nerve diseases: An update of clinical trials

Reviewer's code: 00505049

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-14 11:55

Date reviewed: 2016-06-19 11:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript entitled "Mesenchymal stem cell therapy in retinal and optic nerve diseases: an update of clinical trials" was to review using mesenchymal stem cell (MSCs) therapy in patients with neurodegenerative pathologies of optic nerve and retina. The authors found that most of the clinical trials using MSCs are in I/II phase, recruiting patients or ongoing, and they have as main objective the safety assessment of MSCs using various routes of administration. However, it is important to recognize that, there is still a long way to go to reach clinical trials phase III/IV. Hence, it is necessary to continue preclinical and clinical studies to improve this new therapeutic tool. This is an interesting and well written manuscript, worth to be published, no any comment or question.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 27631

Title: Mesenchymal stem cell therapy in retinal and optic nerve diseases: An update of clinical trials

Reviewer's code: 00505066

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-14 11:55

Date reviewed: 2016-06-21 23:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper has reviewed all human clinical trials of using MSCs for retinal and optic nerve diseases. There are more than twenty clinical trials that use MSCs to treat retinal dystrophies, diabetic retinopathy, glaucoma, optic nerve atrophy and age-related macular degeneration. Although most of the clinical trials are in I/II phase, and there is still a long way to go to reach clinical trials phase III-IV. It might be opportunity to perform the translation of treatment approach to the clinical practice. So, it is a good manuscript to be published.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 27631

Title: Mesenchymal stem cell therapy in retinal and optic nerve diseases: An update of clinical trials

Reviewer's code: 00505209

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-14 11:55

Date reviewed: 2016-06-25 18:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I consider this manuscript to be valuable summary of MSCs therapies in the filed of ophthalmology. I commend it for publication without changes

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Stem Cells

ESPS manuscript NO: 27631

Title: Mesenchymal stem cell therapy in retinal and optic nerve diseases: An update of clinical trials

Reviewer's code: 00505222

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Shui Qiu

Date sent for review: 2016-06-14 11:55

Date reviewed: 2016-06-27 13:48

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear authors, This manuscript is very good and well reviewed about the clinical trials using mesenchymal stem cells to treat retinal and optic nerve diseases. We need this kind of manuscript to assess the current situation of the stem cell study. In doing so, clinical trials phase III-IV could be under way. I recommend this article to be published with priority.