

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13226

Title: Application value of C-arm lipiodol CT in TACE for small hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 02860745

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-08-13 20:22

Date reviewed: 2014-08-17 07:51

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations, This is a well written paper, with clear goals and a very nice design. The early diagnosis of HCC, and the role of Carm lipiodol CT are very interesting. However, lipiodol CT has been suggested as a diagnostic approach in the past, with negative results; as shown in this paper: [Computerized tomography with lipiodol in hepatocarcinoma. Assessment of its diagnostic accuracy with anatomic-pathological control]. Veltri A, Robba T, Anselmetti GC, Martina MC, Regge D, Grosso M, Fava C. Radiol Med. 1998 Jul-Aug;96(1-2):81-6. Review. I would like for the authors to include in their discussion of the paper the pitfalls of this technique in the past, the improvement it would offer to current diagnostic strategies and the role it could have in the present. Also, perhaps some of this patients were transplanted? Is there correlation with anatomic-pathology? Regarding tables, results should be summarized, and presented in percentages.

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13226

Title: Application value of C-arm lipiodol CT in TACE for small hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 02860590

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-08-13 20:22

Date reviewed: 2014-08-30 01:27

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Article – Application value of C-arm lipiodol CT in TACE for small hepatocellular carcinoma. This study evaluated the value of C-arm lipiodol CT for intra-procedural hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) lesion detection during transcatheter arterial chemoembolization (TACE). My specific queries and comments are below: ? Please, get a native English speaker to check the English used in the paper. Various sentences should be reviewed due to grammatical error. Abstract (271 words): ? The characteristics of the patients are not well described such as age, sex, severity and aetiology of baseline disease and presence of other comorbidities. Furthermore, the text should be reviewed due to grammatical error. ? Page 1, line 8, the authors should extend the following abbreviation DSA, Digital subtraction angiography. Introduction (146 words): ? 2. Page 1, lines 22-27: There are not spaces between words. ? The introduction section is under-elaborated. There is limited information regarding a theoretical framework that grounds the research. Material and Methods (514 words): ? The characteristics of the patients are not well described such as age, sex, severity of baseline disease and presence of other comorbidities. ? In table 1, legends should contain sufficient information to provide an adequate understanding of the table by the reader without reference to the text. In the legend, the authors should extend the following abbreviation in the inferior legend: AFP, slice-CT, HCC, TACE. ? The table 1 is not clear. ? Page 4, lines 5-7 - statistics: Were the data distributed normally? If not, then perhaps medians would be better than means. Results (139 words): ? The



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

results section is under-elaborated. The findings should be more elaborated. Discussion (500 words): ? The authors present a very positive view of C-arm lipiodol CT. There are certainly some studies that suggest C-arm lipiodol CT can be helpful. However, I believe there are other studies that do not show the same results. To be balanced, it would be helpful to show both sides. Moreover grammatical errors/constructions should be evaluated along the whole article. ? Accept but needs revision (major and minor).

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 13226

Title: Application value of C-arm lipiodol CT in TACE for small hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer code: 02860618

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-08-13 20:22

Date reviewed: 2014-09-01 16:39

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | RECOMMENDATION | CONCLUSION |
|---|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | Google Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper by Zheng J and co-workers aimed at studying the diagnostic performance of C-arm lipiodol CT in small HCC immediately after TACE, concluding that it is highly diagnostic. Even though the Authors provide some expertise in this field, I would suggest some revisions: 1 - the manuscript is not clearly written. For instance, the utility of C-arm lipiodol CT in small HCC (and not every size HCC) should be more stressed; moreover, please better elucidate the aim of the study; 2 - please check for several grammar and typos errors (it should be better to involve an English native speaker); 3 - please provide more information about the patients enrolled in the study (biochemistry, MELD score, etc...) 4 - please explain what was the statistical procedure used for the analysis.