

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10818**Title:** Circulating Tumor Cells and Cancer Stem Cells in HCV Genotype4-Associated Liver Disease and Hepatocellular Carcinoma**Reviewer code:** 02861333**Science editor:** Yuan Qi**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-21 19:00**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-27 11:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript need be revised. There are many errors. For example, in the abstract, "cancer stem cell (CSC) were recently used", should be "cancer stem cells (CSCs) were recently used". Why the number of CD133+ cells was lower in HCC than CH group? Some conclusions should be debated, such as, "This confirms the utility of FCM in enumerating CTCs and thus it can be used to monitor CH patients for early detection of HCC, being sensitive and easy, relatively less costly, and more rapid compared to the currently used techniques such as PCR or Cell Search". From the results of this study, we can not know CTCs is an early diagnosis or predict marker of HCC.

ESPS Peer-review Report**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 10818**Title:** Circulating Tumor Cells and Cancer Stem Cells in HCV Genotype4-Associated Liver Disease and Hepatocellular Carcinoma**Reviewer code:** 02861340**Science editor:** Yuan Qi**Date sent for review:** 2014-04-21 19:00**Date reviewed:** 2014-04-30 12:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this study, the authors examined the expression of AFP, CK19, telomerase, MAGE1, MAGE3, CD90, CD133 by real time PCR or flowcytometry. The expressions of telomerase, CD90, CD133, MAGE3, and CK19 were significantly associated with high grade and advanced stage in HCC patients. They concluded that telomerase, CD90, CD133, MAGE3, and CK19 are prognostic markers in HCC patients. The below are the concerns from the reviewer. 1) How many patients are HCV-based and HBV-based HCC? How about the comparison of these markers in HCV- and HBV-based HCC? 2) Why did the authors focus on CK19, telomerase, MAGE1, MAGE3, CD90 in this study. It would be nice to more clearly describe the designing of the study. 3) The authors examined the expression of these markers only in NC, CH, and HCC. Do the markers not express in other tissue cancers or other pathogenic conditions in the liver? 4) What's the advantages of the markers clarified in this study over those currently used in clinical?

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 10818

Title: Circulating Tumor Cells and Cancer Stem Cells in HCV Genotype4-Associated Liver Disease and Hepatocellular Carcinoma

Reviewer code: 02861277

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-04-21 19:00

Date reviewed: 2014-04-30 19:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Bahnassy Abeer A. and colleagues studied the use of flow cytometry analysis to count the number of circulating tumor cells (CTCs) and cancer stem cells (CSCs) in HCV patients affected from hepatocellular carcinoma. They reported that CTCs/CSCs enumeration by flow cytometry could be an easy way to detect HCC cases, as well as to prognosticate patient's outcomes. In my opinion, the present paper should be deeply revised. Major aspects: The authors reported no significant differences concerning CK19 expression between HCC and CH groups (page 10), while considering the cut-off they become significant (please clarify). Table 3: standard deviation is higher than the respective values, how is possible? (Please clarify). Figure 2: representative dot plots for all groups should be shown. Real time PCR: Has RNA extraction been performed from all cells stratified after centrifugation, included leukocytes? (Please clarify) Minor aspects: A legend for acronyms should always reported.