

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 26864

Title: Cognitive behavioural therapy for auditory hallucinations in schizophrenia: A review

Reviewer's code: 02445298

Reviewer's country: Slovenia

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-04-28 20:47

Date reviewed: 2016-05-04 18:09

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear dr. Lian-Sheng Ma, President and Company Editor-in-Chief, The article "CBT for Auditory Hallucinations" I can recommend for a publication in WJP. The topic is interesting, informative and useful for a clinician. The paper is clearly written. It needs some minor changes and explanations before publication: Title: The CBT is well known abbreviation but abbreviations can not be used in the title, so I do suggest to write it in full as Cognitive Behavioural Psychotherapy for Auditory Hallucinations. Materials and methods: For the reader it will be very usefull the description about the antipsychotics, if he dosages were stable or not in all of the studies.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 26864

Title: Cognitive behavioural therapy for auditory hallucinations in schizophrenia: A review

Reviewer's code: 02445686

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-04-28 20:47

Date reviewed: 2016-05-06 21:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

World Journal of Psychiatry Manuscript NO: 26864 Title "An overview of recent findings on CBT for Auditory Hallucinations in Schizophrenia" It is a review of eight article suggesting that Cognitive-Behavioral Therapy (CBT) is a useful treatment for reducing compliance with harmful command hallucination. Authors underline that they found some preliminary evidence for the efficacy of CBT in the treatment of command hallucinations. It seems difficult to understand what the Authors intend when they speak of "reducing compliance" with harmful command hallucination. They should clarify. It should be interesting to know the antipsychotic drugs (names and dosages) associated to CBT to know the possible combination effects of some specific molecule. Or was the CBT the unique therapy ? It is not credible.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Psychiatry

ESPS manuscript NO: 26864

Title: Cognitive behavioural therapy for auditory hallucinations in schizophrenia: A review

Reviewer's code: 01760667

Reviewer's country: Sweden

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-04-28 20:47

Date reviewed: 2016-05-11 20:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Apart from the critics below - the manuscript need spelling and grammar correction. Otherwise it is overall a valuable contribution to clinical practice. Review an overview of recent findings on CBT for Auditory Hallucinations in Schizophrenia Title It is not recommendable to use abbreviations in a title. The word "recent" should be avoided, it loses rapidly its actuality. Furthermore, a lengthy title attract less attention. The title would merit from being shorter and spell out CBT. (i.e. Cognitive behavioral therapy for auditory hallucinations in schizophrenia, a review.) Introduction Third line "related psychotic disorders" is a vague label. Delusional disorders typically don't exhibit auditory hallucinations although they are among psychotic disorders. The frequency of AH applies to schizophrenia and the word "related psychotic disorders" should be erased. Some language correction is needed (i.e. "most high") Aim: should be confined to state the objective of the present article and not describe other studies - they should have been mentioned beforehand. Apart from the comments above, the introduction is well written and summarizes the motives for the aim. Method It is stated that it is a qualitative review. This should further be explained or omitted. A

rational for the chosen time frame should be given. Has there been a review covering a period before 2012? In the last sentence it is stated that eight studies fulfilled the inclusion criteria. These criteria as well as the exclusion criteria should be given. Result A somewhat lengthy but informative result section. The direction of the correlation between outcome and negative symptoms should be given for the Thomas et al study. In the Hutton and Morrison study the phrase "single case study" should not be used. It refers to an established quantitative method for treatment studies. Instead "case study" should be used. Conclusions Second sentence should be corrected. Only two studies showed superiority to standard care in some but not all outcome measures. The other studies were observational and did not include controls (except the Mortan study). This sentence should be corrected. Third sentence – the direction of the negative symptom to treatment efficacy should be stated. The description of the different CBT models should be given in the method section and only briefly referred to in the conclusion section. A paragraph on limitations and strengths should be included in the conclusion section. One limitation is that the actual antipsychotic medication is not accounted for in this review. It is important information for instance if or if not patients are on clozapine, polypharmacy etc. Another is the discrepancy of methods and outcome measures between studies, a third is that most studies are underpowered. Among strengths, that there are at least two methodologically sound studies and that most of the studies point in the same direction justifying the conclusion that CBT may be an alternative for individuals with schizophrenia who experience AH despite antipsychotic treatment.