



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 21129

Title: Controversial role of arthroscopic meniscectomy of the knee: A review

Reviewer's code: 02699758

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2015-07-02 15:37

Date reviewed: 2015-07-14 11:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors reviewed five randomized controlled trials (RCTs) that compared the efficacy of arthroscopic partial meniscectomy (APM), with or without programmed exercise, to non-operative treatment for meniscal tears. They focused particularly on the results of selection bias and the effect of crossovers between the two groups. The authors concluded that each RCT had more or less selection bias, and that crossovers remain a significant problem in surgical RCTs. I completely agree with the authors' analysis and conclusions. In clinical trials, especially those including surgical intervention, randomization is too difficult and crossovers cannot be avoided. This paper was concise and well written. I recommend publication of their manuscript without revisions.