

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24495

**Title:** Medial ulnar collateral ligament reconstruction of the elbow in major league baseball players: Where do we stand?

**Reviewer's code:** 03070252

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-25 14:08

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-29 01:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall, good review of the available literature on the topic. Minor edits are required prior to publishing. Also, it would be worthwhile to include a paragraph or two about how the diagnosis of UCL injury is made. Is it possible that ortho surgeons are diagnosing more of these injuries with current advances in exam/imaging? Or that surgeons are diagnosing less severe/partial injuries, which would explain the increase in reconstructive surgeries?

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24495

**Title:** Medial ulnar collateral ligament reconstruction of the elbow in major league baseball players: Where do we stand?

**Reviewer's code:** 02705018

**Reviewer's country:** Greece

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-25 14:08

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-31 07:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an overall well structured manuscript. I propose publication.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Orthopedics

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24495

**Title:** Medial ulnar collateral ligament reconstruction of the elbow in major league baseball players: Where do we stand?

**Reviewer's code:** 03069301

**Reviewer's country:** Spain

**Science editor:** Xue-Mei Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-25 14:08

**Date reviewed:** 2016-02-14 16:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors carry out a descriptive study based on references, not a paper producing evidences. Methodology is not well described (databases used, criteria for paper selection, etc.). The structure of the paper should be improved, specifying background, purpose, study design, methods, results and conclusion. Also the contribution to general knowledge is not new. Several previous studies reported an increase in the prevalence of medial ulnar collateral ligament and recent studies regard the incidence and demographic distribution. Although most media and literature regarding ulnar collateral ligament reconstruction surround Major League Baseball and elite-level pitchers, this cohort of players constitute a very small percentage of the overall patient population undergoing these procedures. By the way, Erickson (Am J Sports Med July 2015 43(7): 1770-1774) paper -not cited by the authors- reported that this reconstruction was performed significantly more in patients aged 15-19 years than in any other age group. The own title uses a somewhat confusing terminology: Ulnar collateral ligament of what? (thumb, elbow...). We think there are some other papers with better methodology and this one adds nothing new.