

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27279

Title: Increased ATG5-ATG12 in HBV-associated hepatocellular carcinoma and their role in apoptosis

Reviewer's code: 00225318

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-05-23 10:38

Date reviewed: 2016-05-23 11:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript "Increased ATG5-ATG12 in HBV-associated hepatocellular carcinoma and Their role in apoptosis" of Kunanopparat A et al. is focused on a topic of great interest as they are the possible molecular markers of hepatocellular carcinoma associated with HBV infection. The experimental approach and hypotheses are correct although it is somewhat surprising that an increase ATG5 be associated with tumor development when as the authors themselves point out in their introduction mosaic Atg5 - / - mice developed benign liver tumors, perhaps associated with tihat autophagy can function as tumor suppressor during early cancer process but as a promoter of tumorigenesis at later stage. However it is assumed the possible difference between animal models and real human pathology and even the mysterious influence of HBV and protein HBX. Authors should clearly indicate the risk posed assume a suppresion of these genes associated with the possible onset of liver cancer and therefore only assume it in cancers clearly established as a therapeutic measure to prevent its development. ??The work is interesting and should be known by other researchers, in order to analyze their hypothesis. The only significant limitation is the determination of levels of RNA using



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

commercial (2X) Power SYBR Green. In this sense it must be confirmed positive cases and their levels by using specific Taqman probes or FRET type.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27279

Title: Increased ATG5-ATG12 in HBV-associated hepatocellular carcinoma and their role in apoptosis

Reviewer's code: 00506552

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-05-23 10:38

Date reviewed: 2016-06-12 15:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors of this manuscript titled as 'Increased ATG5-ATG12 in HBV-associated hepatocellular carcinoma and their role in apoptosis' demonstrated that ATG5-ATG12 are increased HepG2.2.15 cells and HBV-associated HCC tumor tissues. In the Results section, it was better to mark as from Fig. 1A through Fig 1E at the end of each sentence, not like 'Fig. 1' after several sentences that explain the Fig 1 results. Fig. 1, 2 and 3 can be combined in one figure. such as Fig. 1. In Fig. 3, it would be nice to see the real protein bands, at least one or two representative samples compare to the adjacent non tumors and non HBV-HCCs. Fig. 5 and 6 can be combined in one figure. The quality of Fig. 6A needs to be improved since the percentage in the fig. are not recognizable. Especially, it need to make clear that it was not the reuse of their data from their previous publication by Kunanopparat et al., 2016 from Asian Pac J Allergy Immunol. In Fig. 7 and 9, the open bar was HepG2 and the closed bar was HepG2.2.15 as Fig. 6 and 8?? Most importantly, it would be nice to demonstrate that effect of HBV replication by over-expression and knock-down of ATG12 since they used HBV replicating HepG2.2.15 cells for their experiments.