

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 43148

**Title:** Incidence, risk factors and clinical outcome of BK polyomavirus infection after kidney transplantation: an observational study.

**Reviewer's code:** 00054465

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-10-31

**Date reviewed:** 2018-10-31

**Review time:** 8 Hours

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                                     | LANGUAGE QUALITY   | CONCLUSION                                 | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS                      |
|--|--|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept | Peer-Review:                                  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language                 | (High priority)                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept            | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of                | (General priority)                         | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the              |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not               | language polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision    | topic of the manuscript:                      |
| publish  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision    | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced             |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General   |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise         |
|  |  |  | Conflicts-of-Interest:                        |
|  |  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes                  |
|  |  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No        |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

As you state this is a large single center observational study examining BKV infection after kidney transplantation. You have identified a major problem for some patients that will eventually lead to loss of graft. New anti-BKV strategies are needed. A well



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

written manuscript

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 43148

**Title:** Incidence, risk factors and clinical outcome of BK polyomavirus infection after kidney transplantation: an observational study.

**Reviewer's code:** 02885976

**Reviewer's country:** Argentina

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-19

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-20

**Review time:** 1 Day

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                          | LANGUAGE QUALITY                                      | CONCLUSION                              | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS              |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept         | Peer-Review:                          |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language      | (High priority)                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous    |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good      | polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept         | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous      |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair      | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of     | (General priority)                      | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the      |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not    | language polishing                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript:              |
| publish                                     | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection           | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced     |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection      | <input type="checkbox"/> General      |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
|   |   |   | Conflicts-of-Interest:                |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes          |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No           |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent observational study by Favi et al. They clearly describes the incidence, risk factors and clinical outcomes of one of the main infections following kidney transplantation. The study was well designed, with appropriate references, very



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

demonstrative figures, meet the requirements of biostatistics analysis, and describes an adequate discussion, highlighting the key points concisely, clearly and logically. I consider it meritorious to be published.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Clinical Cases

**Manuscript NO:** 43148

**Title:** Incidence, risk factors and clinical outcome of BK polyomavirus infection after kidney transplantation: an observational study.

**Reviewer's code:** 00503286

**Reviewer's country:** Romania

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-11-19

**Date reviewed:** 2018-11-25

**Review time:** 6 Days

| SCIENTIFIC QUALITY                          | LANGUAGE QUALITY                                      | CONCLUSION                              | PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS              |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept         | Peer-Review:                          |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language      | (High priority)                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous    |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good      | polishing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept         | <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous      |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair      | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of     | (General priority)                      | Peer-reviewer's expertise on the      |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not    | language polishing                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision | topic of the manuscript:              |
| publish                                     | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection           | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision | <input type="checkbox"/> Advanced     |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection      | <input type="checkbox"/> General      |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No expertise |
|   |   |   | Conflicts-of-Interest:                |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes          |
|   |   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No           |

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper "Incidence, risk factors and clinical outcome of BK polyomavirus infection after kidney transplantation: an observational study" should be published in journal after the formal minor corrections with the editor.



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No