

**ESPS Peer-review Report****Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6527**Title:** Towards personalized peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer**Reviewer code:** 00068458**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-23 17:46**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-23 13:04

| CLASSIFICATION                                     | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing     | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)            |  | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |  |

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The authors have reviewed good studies for "Peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer". However, the manuscript cannot be printed at current status. Major comments; 1. The authors described that this article will review the personalized peri-operative treatment of gastric cancer, discussing the appropriate indication for peri-operative treatment.... in "Introduction" section. However, this article reviewed general effect of chemotherapy for gastric cancer, but not personalized. For example, the authors did not suggest any particular biomarker/indicator or diagnostic tools for personalized treatment. Thus, the main purpose of this article is not clear. If the authors provide more information biomarker or diagnostic test/tool for tailored therapy, it will enhance the significance to this review. 2. In "pretherapeutic evaluation of advanced gastric cancer" section, the authors reviewed general histologic and radiologic diagnosis. Again, the contents did not provide new insight or information for pretherapeutic evaluation for personalized therapy. 3. The authors should cite and discuss the recent paper published in Gastroenterology (Lei Z et al, Gastroenterology, 2013;145:554-565). 4. The authors have reviewed and listed many good studies. Because the article is so complicated, it is not easy for readers to read and to understand them completely. Please use table or figures in the text. 5. N stage (metastatic lymph node number) of gastric cancer has been changed. The authors should describe in text. 6. In subtitle of "peri-operative target therapy", the description about imaging and biomarkers for the prediction of the chemotherapy effect is not likely appropriate to the topic. They should focus on the target therapy. 7. In "summary", the authors described that genomic profiling may also be an unignored tool in the personalized treatment of gastric cancer. However, there is no description about genomic profiling in main text. 8. The authors need to describe very clearly what



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, United States

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com) <http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

author's suggestion is for personalized peri-operative treatment.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6527

**Title:** Towards personalized peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer

**Reviewer code:** 01333284

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-23 17:46

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-24 04:00

| CLASSIFICATION                                     | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing                           | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) |   | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |  |

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The review by Miao et al entitled "Towards personalized peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer" details the current management of gastric cancer. Please address the following comments: 1. There are numerous grammatical and syntax errors requiring extensive language revision. 2. The Introduction states that a limited D1 is "more frequently used in Western countries" does have a recent reference of a 12year old trial. Please provide a more recent series. 3. The introduction also summarizes world practice patterns of Europe, the US and East Asia. These practice patterns need to be referenced.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6527

**Title:** Towards personalized peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer

**Reviewer code:** 00068182

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-23 17:46

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-26 17:56

| CLASSIFICATION                                     | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing                 | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)            |   | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                            | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision     |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |  |

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Surgery alone does not achieve the best results for the treatment of gastric cancer; Perioperative chemotherapy is tolerable, but currently no recommended standardization programs; I think deferent chemotherapy do not has the same Efficacy, So RCT is needed. I think the author has find a good topic. But Materials need to arrange for a reasonable order. It not so easy for me to read through it. About the part of discussion, some part do not has a good response with the main text.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6527

**Title:** Towards personalized peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer

**Reviewer code:** 02372763

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-23 17:46

**Date reviewed:** 2013-12-31 23:22

| CLASSIFICATION                                     | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|--|---|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing                 | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection          |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair) |   | BPG Search:                         |  |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                            | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The authors reviewed the personalized peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer in details. However, the descriptions are redundant and difficult to read for the readers. The organization of the context is not outstanding.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**
**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6527

**Title:** Towards personalized peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer

**Reviewer code:** 01468173

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-23 17:46

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-01 14:32

| CLASSIFICATION                                     | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing     | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)            |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS: Thank you for submitting your paper. This manuscript is well written and will be accepted with minor revision. You reviewed major RCT reports such as ACTS-GC, CLASSIC trial et al. You stated the positive sides of these trials, such as overall survival, PFS, and so on. However, you don't state the negative sides, for example, toxicity, compliance, or rate to accomplish initial dose. Could you comment this?

# ESPS Peer-review Report

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 6527

**Title:** Towards personalized peri-operative treatment for gastric cancer

**Reviewer code:** 00042772

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2013-10-23 17:46

**Date reviewed:** 2014-01-07 21:05

| CLASSIFICATION                                     | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION   |
|--|--|-------------------------------------|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing     | Google Search:                      | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good) | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)            |  | BPG Search:                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected                           | <input type="checkbox"/> Existed    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records |  |

# COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It's a goog manuscript as introduction for other papers that develop the various topics.