

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22949

Title: Deficiency of platelet-derived growth factor receptor- α -positive cells in Hirschsprung's disease colon

Reviewer's code: 01213502

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-08 14:48

Date reviewed: 2015-10-18 10:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors submitted an article entitled "DEFICIENCY OF PLATELET-DERIVED GROWTH FACTOR RECEPTOR- α -POSITIVE CELLS (PDGFR α -CELLS) IN THE COLON OF HIRSCHSPRUNG'S DISEASE" It is interesting to the readers and may have clinical benefit for differential diagnosis in difficult cases. However, the control group "Imperforated anus patients" the authors used seemed need some more discussions. In the literature, association of Hirschsprung's disease in "imperforated anus" had been reported to be 2~4%. Please do more discussions in this point of view. By the way, a whole spelling should be done first before the abbreviation of "PDGFR α +" used.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22949

Title: Deficiency of platelet-derived growth factor receptor- α -positive cells in Hirschsprung's disease colon

Reviewer's code: 00994809

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-10-08 14:48

Date reviewed: 2015-10-19 18:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript of O'Donnell et al. analysed the expression of PDGFR α + cells in human tissues originated from patients suffering in Hirschsprung's disease. This is an important point to show the distribution of these cells in gastrointestinal disease, like Hirschsprung's disease. However, I miss here the clear statement of the aim of the study. The authors introduced several animal studies where the PDGFR α + cell expression and function was studied. Therefore in this study I would expect more than a pure statement that these cells also express here. This is not a surprising finding. It would be more important to find out why they are expressed in this disease, what kind function is supposed to be for these cells. Why they express the TLR4, TLR5 and the purinergic receptors? What kind of role should they have in the development of this disease? Major points: The histological pictures need some improvement. In the picture A, B, and C, it will be helpful for the reader to indicate by arrow where are the cell bodies and where are the projections. The magnification is missing in all pictures. Beside the western blot a quantitative analyses of the PDGFR α + areas is essential. The picture of the western blot gel is not informative enough. Please show the entire gel and not a cut off, to make sure



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

that the expression is specific. Minor points: More details are needed about the control samples. Are these subjects healthy, etc.?