

To the Editor in Chief,

*World Journal of Gastroenterology,*

**Manuscript NO:** 40712

**Manuscript Type:** EDITORIAL.

Please find enclosed a point-by-point response of the original submission entitled "*Hepatocellular carcinoma in Latin America: diagnosis and treatment challenges*".

**Authors:** Federico Piñero<sup>1,2</sup>, Jaime Poniachik<sup>3,4</sup>, Ezequiel Ridruejo<sup>1,2,5</sup> and Marcelo Silva<sup>1,2</sup>.

**Correspondence to:** Federico Piñero, MD, Academic Research, Doctor, Research Scientist, Staff Physician, Hepatology and Liver Transplantation Unit, Hospital Universitario Austral, Av Juan Domingo Perón 1500, Buenos Aires B1629HJ, Pilar, Argentina. fpinerof@cas.austral.edu.ar

**Reviewer code:** 03656588, 02441161, and 02822428

**First decision:** 2018-08-01

**Science editor:** Ruo-Yu Ma

**Special comments from the editor:**

Please revise your manuscript according to the file "40712-Edited (download)-1" uploaded by the editor on August 6.

1. Please rearrange the number of the references according to the order in which the cited references appear in the main text. (For example, Reference #26 and #27 should be numbered as #10 and #11, respectively) (Highlighted on Page 6, Line 9)
2. Reference #28 cannot be found cited in the main text. Please check and confirm that all of the references are cited in the right order and format! (Highlighted on Page 15)

3. Please add the number of the cited references in the tables. (Highlighted on Pages 18 and 19)

*Response: We answered and made corrections according to the Editor's suggestions, which were highlighted in the manuscript. We have carefully rearranged the number and order of the references and included them in both tables the best we could. Reference number 28 is now number 5.*

Previous R1.

Please provide language certificate letter by professional English language editing companies (Classification of manuscript language quality evaluation is B). For manuscripts submitted by non-native speakers of English, please provided language certificate by professional English language editing companies mentioned in 'The Revision Policies of BPG for Article'.

*Response: We have reviewed the manuscript with the Department of Languages from the Austral University Hospital. The letter was submitted earlier. However, since some changes have been done after including the reviewers' comments and suggestions.*

**Audio core tip:**

In order to attract readers to read your full-text article, we request that the author make an audio file describing your final core tip, it is necessary for final acceptance. Please refer to Instruction to authors on our website or attached Format for detailed information. The accepted formats are mp3 or wma.

*Response: We now submit the audio core tip as requested.*

Please include figures or tables in the main text of your revised manuscript, and provide the decomposable figure of Figures, whose parts are movable and editable. So you can put the original pictures in PPT and submit it in the system. (Your manuscript cannot be accepted without figures or tables).

*Response: We have included 2 Tables and 1 figure as recommended.*

Please revise and perfect your manuscript according to peer-reviewers' comments.

*Response: We have carefully reviewed and previously done and wrote the paper according to the Guidelines. We have changed and made all the Editor's suggestions, which are highlighted in the manuscript. We have previously submitted all the required files accordingly. We further include now all of them again together with the above suggestions from the Associate Editor. The School of English from the Austral University Hospital reviews all the papers from the hospital.*

- (1) 40712-Revised Manuscript: **Submitted**
- (2) 40712-Answering Reviewers: **Submitted**
- (3) 40712-Audio Core Tip: **Submitted**
- (4) 40712-Conflict-of-Interest Disclosure Form: **Submitted**
- (5) 40712-Copyright License Agreement: **Submitted**
- (6) 40712-Approved Grant Application Form(s) or Funding Agency Copy of any Approval Document(s): **NC**
- (7) 40712-Non-Native Speakers of English Editing Certificate: **Submitted**
- (8) 40712-Video: **NC**
- (9) 40712-Image File: **Submitted**
- (10) 40712-Supplementary Material: **NC**

#### REVIEWER'S COMMENTS:

Reviewer n<sup>o</sup>1.

Review Date: 2018-07-31 00:08

This editorial is appropriate and adequate in length. The presentation with a clinical case is also interesting and original. However, I think that the editorial sometimes just rely on anecdotes and it would be interesting to present a bit more of data. For instance, Gross Domestic Product (GDP) per capita data are presented but not epidemiological data regarding hepatocellular carcinoma (which may vary according to different countries epidemiology). I also find surprising that very few or no data regarding adherence or treatment are presented. Finally, I think that authors should make some specific recommendations for HCC management, at least one or two that they find to be of highest priority for the majority of countries. Another point: Are any consortia already working in this field? It should be mentioned in order to enhance visibility. Authors should keep in mind that point (.) is used as decimal separator in English. So, sentences like "above 0,45 for the year" or "Denmark all have GINI scores less than 0,30", should be corrected. Sentences like "Years ago, he was already diagnosed with clinically compensated cirrhosis but with portal hypertension" are awkward and therefore I suggest that the manuscript be corrected by a native English Speaker

Scientific Quality: Grade C (Good)

Language Quality: Grade B (Minor language polishing)

Conclusion: Major revision

Review Date: 2018-07-31 00:08

*Response: We thank for the reviewer's comments. We added more data as requested including epidemiology of HCC in Latin America (page 5, last paragraph), additional references (#6 #7) and two tables (Table 1 regarding surveillance for HCC in Latin America and Table 2 regarding adherence to BCLC around the world). For specific recommendations, we have added a Figure that resumes the key points addressed on the last paragraph in Perspectives.*

*Regarding consortia: LALREAN is a consortium that is working in the region since 2014 promoting research, education and awareness among different countries from Latin America and many publications have been done (please see Ref#28). We have added a comment on page 10 as suggested.*

*Decimal separator has been corrected as requested.*

*We have reviewed again the whole manuscript with an English native speaker. Changes are highlighted.*

Reviewer n°2.

Review Date: 2018-07-24 06:00

Piñero F et al. reviewed the diagnosis and treatment of HCC in Latin America. The theme is very interesting and well analyzed the problems of the current Latin American medical system. Unfortunately, I could not find the HCC guidelines for Latin America in reference 3, because I could not find it on the Internet. The BCLC staging system recommends strictly one treatment option depending on the stage. However, as noted by the authors, these guidelines do not apply in many clinical cases. In addition, Asia (APASL), Japan, and South Korea HCC association recommend different treatment algorithms differ from the BCLC staging system treatment recommendations. Therefore, the authors need to add that there are other opinions besides the recommendations based on BCLC staging in HCC treatment.

Scientific Quality: Grade C (Good)

Language Quality: Grade B (Minor language polishing)

Conclusion: Accept (General priority)

Specific Comments To Authors (File):

Review Date: 2018-07-24 06:00

*Response: We thank for the reviewer's comment. The ALEH guidelines are published on Annals of Hepatology, a journal that is indexed on PubMed. We have corrected the reference #3. We have edited and checked the English once again as suggested. All changes were highlighted. We agree that there are different guidelines and recommendations, but we have focused on AASLD and EASL guidelines because most of the Latin American hepatologists follow these guidelines rather than those from APASL. However, we know that WJG has many readers from Asia and consequently, as requested we have included this suggestion in the manuscript and an additional Ref#5 underling that treatment options are wide and heterogeneous around the world. Thus, enhancing that HCC therapeutic options and clinical-decision-making processes are difficult in the daily practice.*

*We answered and made corrections according to the Editor's and each reviewer's suggestions, which were highlighted in the manuscript. We have carefully answered and included all these suggestions the best we could. We believe this report to be novel, interesting and appropriate subject matter to the readership of World Journal of Gastroenterology.*

*All the authors have contributed to and agreed on the content of the manuscript. The manuscript has not been published previously in any language, in whole or in part and is not currently under consideration elsewhere.*

*Yours Sincerely,*

*Dr Federico Piñero on behalf of all co-authors.*