

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24358

**Title:** MicroRNAs AS POSSIBLE BIOMARKERS FOR DIAGNOSIS AND PROGNOSIS OF HEPATITIS B- AND HEPATITIS C-RELATED HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA: PROGRESS AND PROMISES

**Reviewer's code:** 00503630

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-20 19:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-26 00:11

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            |   | BPG Search:                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|   |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

please see minor edits in the attached documents. My major issues are 1) Is any MiRNA levels or SNP used for any cancer decision/prognostication yet? I suspect not in. If you think this is a area worth further study you should state what cancer has the best MiRNA data behind it and what the HCC field would need to get there. 2) despite cataloging a large number of papers, you never really quantitate the strength of current evidence for miRNAs. You state one is likely not enough but it would be useful for you to "rank" them in some rough order of which has the highest potential/best current evidence 3) Is there any MiRNA data in nonhepatitis virus HCC (or alcoholic liver disease wo HCC?) Often HCC is not a matter of just viral hepatitis but also steatohepatitis +/- alcohol

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24358

**Title:** MicroRNAs AS POSSIBLE BIOMARKERS FOR DIAGNOSIS AND PROGNOSIS OF HEPATITIS B- AND HEPATITIS C-RELATED HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA: PROGRESS AND PROMISES

**Reviewer's code:** 03262371

**Reviewer's country:** Iran

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-20 19:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-29 01:53

| CLASSIFICATION   | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION  |
|--|---|--|---|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                                   |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |   |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor                 |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                           |
|  | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | BPG Search:                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                           |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |   |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |   |
|  |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |   |
|  |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |   |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear editor Thanks for inviting me to review this manuscript from your prestigious journal. It is a nice review article that investigates correlation between miRNAs and hepatitis B and C viruses induced HCC development both in its diagnosis and prognosis. The search strategy and its protocol seem to be appropriate. Eligibility criteria have been described well. The results are very comprehensive however it would be very nice if the authors can summarize data about some of the miRNAs which have enough related studies in a table. I mean authors can design a table based on miRNAs not based on study and evaluate studies for and against a special miRNAs. I think this thing can be done for some of miRNAs and it can give a better view to the readers I have no other comments and I think that the manuscript can be accepted after considering aforementioned comment. Best Regards Mohammad Saeid Rezaee-Zavareh Middle East liver Disease Center, Tehran IR Iran Students' Research Committee, Baqiyatallah University of Medical Sciences, Tehran IR Iran

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24358

**Title:** MicroRNAs AS POSSIBLE BIOMARKERS FOR DIAGNOSIS AND PROGNOSIS OF HEPATITIS B- AND HEPATITIS C-RELATED HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA: PROGRESS AND PROMISES

**Reviewer's code:** 00504271

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-20 19:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-29 09:37

| CLASSIFICATION   | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|--|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing     | Google Search:                                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor                 |  | BPG Search:                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review paper by Sirio et al. describes the possibility of microRNAs as a diagnostic tool of HBV and HCV related liver diseases. As the authors concluded, there is no relationship between microRNA and HBV-HCV related liver diseases according to their analysis. Although this manuscript concluded a negative result, their analysis result can be open to the public. This paper can be published after correction of a few mistyping; p. 12, l. 9: "a) study" should be "a) Study." p. 13, l. 15: ".prognostic tools" should be "prognostic tools."

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24358

**Title:** MicroRNAs AS POSSIBLE BIOMARKERS FOR DIAGNOSIS AND PROGNOSIS OF HEPATITIS B- AND HEPATITIS C-RELATED HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA: PROGRESS AND PROMISES

**Reviewer's code:** 00092173

**Reviewer's country:** Germany

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-20 19:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-01-29 16:09

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION   | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|---|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision     |
|   |   | BPG Search:                                    |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|   |   | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|   |   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dr. Fiorino and colleagues have presented an interesting review article based on a systematic search of the available literature to summarize the current knowledge of the relationship between miRNA expression and HBV or HCV related HCC. From the analysis of the literature the authors conclude that miRNA screening as biomarkers for hepatitis virus related HCC development needs more attention. No specific miRNA or miRNA cluster can be used to define a prognostic value. Overall, the manuscript is well written and mainly concise in its content. The study design is mainly well performed. However, the study showed some limitations which should be addressed. Comments 1. There are some typing errors throughout the manuscript which should be corrected. 2. The authors performed the study from 2000 to 2015; however, miRNA analysis becomes more valid since approx. 2005/2008. For that I suggest to exclude studies before 2005. 3. To give the reader any idea which of the miRNAs or miRNA panels would be useful as biomarkers for HBV/HCV related HCC and/or worthy for further analysis, the authors should give more detailed information concerning this issue.

A table listing or ranking the miRNAs would be helpful 4. The catalogue of literature shown as table is not useful for the reader, however, could be shortened dramatically. It would be better to focus on the miRNAs and their impact on HCC development showing subsequently the references. 5. No comparison has been made concerning non-viral HCC as control panel but would be of high interest if there do exist any differences in miRNA profiles of virus related HCC. 6. What are viral miRNAs in contrast to host miRNAs (page 13, para d)? Should be explained. 7. Why didn't the authors search for RNA-interference or RNAi? These terms might also be relevant for the presented study. 8. The authors should present a clear statement and conclusion of their findings giving any idea of their preference for potentially useful miRNAs.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 24358

**Title:** MicroRNAs AS POSSIBLE BIOMARKERS FOR DIAGNOSIS AND PROGNOSIS OF HEPATITIS B- AND HEPATITIS C-RELATED HEPATOCELLULAR CARCINOMA: PROGRESS AND PROMISES

**Reviewer's code:** 00227665

**Reviewer's country:** South Korea

**Science editor:** Ya-Juan Ma

**Date sent for review:** 2016-01-20 19:39

**Date reviewed:** 2016-02-09 14:38

| CLASSIFICATION   | LANGUAGE EVALUATION  | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT                          | CONCLUSION   |
|--|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent            | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing     | Google Search:                                 | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept             |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing           | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair                 | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                           | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor                 |  | BPG Search:                                    | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title        |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication |  |
|  |  | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism            |  |
|  |  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No         |  |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article describes and summarizes the potential usefulness of miRNAs for the early detection and prognosis evaluation of HBV and/or HCV related HCC through a systematic computer-based search of published articles. Moreover, the authors suggest research directions for the improvement of our knowledge on the potential role of miRNAs for HCC early detection and prognosis. This review was written very concisely and informatively and deserves to be published as its current format.