BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC
8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242 Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology
ESPS manuscript NO: 28961
Title: The preparation and identification of Gpm6a/ReelinGFPCreERT2 construct
Reviewer's code: 00503495
Reviewer's country: United States
Science editor: Yuan Qi
Date sent for review: 2016-08-03 14:53
Date reviewed: 2016-09-16 04:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[ ] The same title	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Duplicate publication	[ ] Rejection
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejected	[ ] Plagiarism	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	[ ] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		[ ] The same title	
		[ ] Duplicate publication	
		[ ] Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript titled, "The preparation and identification of Gpm6a/ReelinGFPCreERT2 construct," (manuscript # 28961) by Shi H. et al. describes how two constructs were cloned using BAC with the use of restriction enzymes and homologous recombination in bacteria. Although the significance of generating these constructs is great, the presentation of the cloning work was rudimentary. Figures were centered on basic cloning/screening gel data which, for most researchers, would not be presented for publication. It would be much better to focus on the pros and cons of the authors' approach in generating these constructs and showed with data that their methods are superior. Specific comments are in the following: 1. Should elaborate on description about hepatic mesothelial cells and hepatic stellate cells in terms of why it is important to generate mouse lines to trace these cells. 2. Is it a common practice to use Gpm6a and Reelin as markers? What are other markers people have used? Why are Gpm6a and Reelin better? 3. What is the common practice in generating these Gpm6a and Reelin constructs? 4. Typo: should be Table I rather than Figure 1. 5. Fig 4 and 5 are not referenced in the text. 6. How does this cloning approach different from Gibson assembly? Need to compare and contrast. 7. Need a flowchart to illustrate cloning strategy. 8. A. and

B. are missing in Fig. 1. Or can use “left” and “right”.