

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9384

**Title:** Herb-partitioned moxibustion and acupuncture for the treatment of active Crohn’s disease: A randomized controlled trial

**Reviewer code:** 01436006

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-12 17:38

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-15 11:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This is a well conducted study to evaluate the clinical efficacy and safety of acupuncture and moxibustion for the treatment of active Crohn’s disease (CD). The authors show the overall efficacy of the treatment was significantly greater than that of the control group. In addition, the patients in the treatment group showed significantly increased hemoglobin, decreased C-reactive protein levels, and histopathological scores at the end of treatment, while the control group did not exhibit significant changes. Acupuncture combined with moxibustion is therefore an effective and safe treatment method to mild and moderate CD. Few issues have to be addressed before the paper can be considered for publication: The discussion were too long, may reduce some. The Table 1 did not be annotated in the manuscripts.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9384

**Title:** Herb-partitioned moxibustion and acupuncture for the treatment of active Crohn's disease: A randomized controlled trial

**Reviewer code:** 02441588

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-12 17:38

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-16 19:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

1. The authors are describing repeatedly that the effect of "acupuncture" is superior to "placebo acupuncture". However, this study compares "the combination of herb-partitioned moxibustion with normal acupuncture" and "the combination of bran-partitioned moxibustion with superficial acupuncture", not the normal acupuncture and the superficial acupuncture. Accurate descriptions are needed. 2. The result shows that the primary outcome of both the treatment group and the control group were reduced, however the improvement in the treatment group was significantly greater than that of the control group. The thermal stimulation of moxibustion was common in both groups, while the pharmaceutical stimulation of moxibustion and acupuncture stimulation were different. It would be needed to describe on the common effect of both groups and the thermal stimulation of moxibustion. In addition, the authors mentioned the acupoints used in this study were selected based on the principles of Chinese Medicine according to the clinical manifestations of the patients. The clinical manifestations of the patients must have varied, however, the acupoints used in this study were same for all patients. Explanations on this may be needed. Joos et al. used mainly acupuncture, with only patient exhibiting Yang deficiency supplemented with moxibustion. However, this study used moxibustion for all patients. Readers may wonder whether the authors consider moxibustion treatment suitable for all CD patients regardless of having Yang deficiency.

**ESPS Peer-review Report**

**Name of Journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS Manuscript NO:** 9384

**Title:** Herb-partitioned moxibustion and acupuncture for the treatment of active Crohn's disease: A randomized controlled trial

**Reviewer code:** 02729474

**Science editor:** Ma, Ya-Juan

**Date sent for review:** 2014-02-12 17:38

**Date reviewed:** 2014-02-20 15:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Mentioning of the practitioner (participating acupuncturists) description such as qualification, years in acupuncture practice and relevant experience could be worth adding to the manuscript. Typos (Eg.: fifth line of the third paragraph under introduction says, "...an herbal cake...", which may be corrected to "...a herbal cake...") and minor spacing errors are present throughout the text including references.