



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 18431

Title: Gastric cancer risk in relation to tobacco use and alcohol drinking in Kerala, India -- Karunagappally Cohort Study

Reviewer's code: 00033010

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-04-21 16:10

Date reviewed: 2015-06-03 23:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present retrospective cohort study, Authors analyzed tobacco smoking and alcohol intake as risk factors for gastric cancer (GC). The main limitation is that it has been conducted on a population with a wide variety in socio-economic conditions. Moreover, the type of smoking (bidi) and alcoholic beverage (toddy and arrack) are widespread only in India, and their preparation may change according to the city where the recipe was formulated. There is no mention about the histopathology of GC. Indeed, it is known that diffuse-type and intestinal-type may show different risk factors. For example, diffuse-type is less influenced by H. pylori and more influenced by genetical factors. Authors did not provide any data about H. pylori status in enrolled patients. This is a relevant drawback, since this bacterium is considered the most important gastric carcinogen. This omission may have interfered with the results provided in the present study. A direct comparison in risk evaluation between bidi smoking and classical cigarette smoking is lacking. The cumulative effect of smoking and drinking has not been analyzed. Another factor that strongly influences GC is the diet, but in the present study an alimentary survey is lacking.