



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2912

Title: Clonality analysis of neuroendocrine cells in gastric adenocarcinoma

Reviewer code: 00057100

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-26 20:33

Date reviewed: 2013-04-02 07:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Dear Editor: I have read with interest the manuscript entitled "Clonality analysis of neuroendocrine cells in gastric adenocarcinoma" by Lingling- Wang and co workers. This is a very interested topic for the readers of WJG. The reasearch is very well design and the conclusions are valuable. The manuscript can be published in the journal after revision. The authors should describe better the laser-captured microdissection and the whole genome amplification.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2912

Title: Clonality analysis of neuroendocrine cells in gastric adenocarcinoma

Reviewer code: 02148395

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-26 20:33

Date reviewed: 2013-04-04 17:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

The manuscript "Clonality analysis of neuroendocrine cells in gastric adenocarcinoma" by L. Wang et al. studied the clonality of neuroendocrine (NE) cells in gastric adenocarcinoma. The authors introduce that it remains unclear whether glandular and endocrine cells within one tumor expand from distinct precursors or from a single progenitor. Using capture microdissection, microsatellite instability, loss of heterozygosity and p53 mutation, the same changes were found in 27/30 tumors, suggesting that in these 27 cases NE cells derive from the same stem cell. The abstract properly reflects the aim of this study and the results. The introduction is appropriate and informative. Material and methods are very detailed, but will be helpful for researchers that want to perform similar experiments. Also the chosen microsatellite markers and the p53 exons are introduced. Statistics are appropriate. The results are briefly, but in sufficient detail presented. The authors discuss that different to other cancer, NED in gastric cancer is more frequently observed in well-differentiated tumors, where NE cells are discussed to derive from multipotent stem cells. They discuss the available information on LOH and MSI in view of their findings and published reports. They close with discussing their and other groups finding on p53 in gastric cancer and argue that NE and adenocarcinoma cell likely derive from the same stem cell in the majority of the tested tumors. In brief, this is an interesting study that is thoroughly performed and interpreted. Abstract, material and methods and presentation of the results is appropriate and the discussion is informative and cites the appropriate literature. The language is correct. I suggest publication of the manuscript in its present form.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Ms: 2912

Title: Clonality analysis of neuroendocrine cells in gastric adenocarcinoma

Reviewer code: 00058340

Science editor: s.x.gou@wjgnet.com

Date sent for review: 2013-03-26 20:33

Date reviewed: 2013-04-11 12:31

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS:

Review of manuscript#2912: Clonality analysis of neuroendocrine cells in gastric adenocarcinoma by Lingling-Wang^{1,2}, Genyou-Yao¹, Zhongsheng-Zhao³, Xiaoli-Wei¹, Rujun-Xu² This is an interesting, well conceived and well designed study. Comments 1. the authors should state whether this study was approved by Human Study Committee (or similar) and specify the name of the Committee. 2. Their method of DNA extraction should be shortened and specific reference to method used provided. 3. I suggest to add some new relevant references e.g. Y. Hirano et al. Combined choriocarcinoma, neuroendocrine cell carcinoma and tubular adenocarcinoma in the stomach World J Gastroenterol. 2008;14(20):3269 -3272 . Gutierrez-Gonzalez L et al Gastroenterology. The clonal origins of dysplasia from intestinal metaplasia in the human stomach. 2011;140(4):1251-1260 S Massironi, Gastric carcinoids: Between underestimation and overtreatment. World J Gastroenterol 15(18):2177 -2183 . Published online 2009 May 14. doi:10.3748/wjg.15.2177.