



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Medical Genetics

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4890

Title: Younger onset age and multiple primary upper gastrointestinal malignancies associated with familial rather than sporadic esophageal squamous cell carcinoma patients suggest an inherited predisposition

Reviewer code: 00180990

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-07-31 17:34

Date reviewed: 2013-08-06 18:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The above mentioned manuscript investigated the differences in familial and sporadic esophageal cancer forms association with genetic predisposition. Although this topic is current, methods used and the results obtained in the paper are of low scientific value. I have some fundamental concerns in how the data is statistically processed and interpreted. The authors must analyze their data with appropriate statistical method. The multivariable regression analyzes must be used, for example general linear model, to obtain valuable results. Strictly, the particular genetic component in ESCC should be proving by WGAS or familial trios' analysis. The conclusion repeats well known fact for genetic predisposition in cancer development and must be strongly revised and suggest at least one specific factor for investigated ESCC. More recently references should be given. The submitted manuscript does not present appropriate scientific data to justify publication. In this regard I did not recommend the acceptance of the manuscript in this form and suggest major revision.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Medical Genetics

ESPS Manuscript NO: 4890

Title: Younger onset age and multiple primary upper gastrointestinal malignancies associated with familial rather than sporadic esophageal squamous cell carcinoma patients suggest an inherited predisposition

Reviewer code: 00631887

Science editor: Zhai, Huan-Huan

Date sent for review: 2013-07-31 17:34

Date reviewed: 2013-09-10 22:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y]Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have analyzed family history of cancer, as well as age at diagnosis and number of tumors, in a cohort of 2,542 patients from Hebei province with history of esophageal squamous cell carcinoma (ESCC) and gastric cardia adenocarcinoma (GCA).