



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 52821

Title: Contemporary Indications for and Outcomes of Hepatic Resection for Neuroendocrine Liver Metastases

Reviewer’s code: 02549888

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: DNB, FRCS (Gen Surg), MBBS, MNAMS

Professional title: Full Professor

Reviewer’s country: India

Author’s country: United States

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-26 10:08

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-26 12:26

Review time: 2 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Title: Apt. Abstract: Well written gives a proper insight of the article. Introduction: Satisfactory. Materials and methods: Quite elaborate. Results: Well tabulated and analyzed. Discussion: Every issue well discussed giving proper justifications. Conclusions drawn are useful. Overall a very good study and analysis.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 52821

Title: Contemporary Indications for and Outcomes of Hepatic Resection for Neuroendocrine Liver Metastases

Reviewer’s code: 00054672

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FEBG, MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer’s country: Croatia

Author’s country: United States

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-21 05:43

Reviewer performed review: 2019-11-28 18:53

Review time: 7 Days and 13 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Thank you for the opportunity to review this manuscript. This is a well written retrospective review of the 2014-2017 ACS-NSQIP results for patients who underwent hepatectomy for neuroendocrine liver metastases, with the 30-day follow-up regarding their morbidity and mortality. Results are well presented followed by focused and comprehensive discussion. This is informative and highly relevant paper and I recommend its publication. Minor comment: please better explain ACS-NSQIP

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 52821

Title: Contemporary Indications for and Outcomes of Hepatic Resection for Neuroendocrine Liver Metastases

Reviewer’s code: 02497043

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer’s country: Turkey

Author’s country: United States

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-26 11:29

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-05 10:55

Review time: 8 Days and 23 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

1. The dot mark in sentences should be after the references.
2. The full name of the abbreviation "LOS" should be written in the place where it were first used.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 52821

Title: Contemporary Indications for and Outcomes of Hepatic Resection for Neuroendocrine Liver Metastases

Reviewer’s code: 03326623

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer’s country: Reviewer_Country

Author’s country: United States

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-11-26 10:10

Reviewer performed review: 2019-12-05 16:56

Review time: 9 Days and 6 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Authors present a potentially interesting registry work on outcome of resection of liver metastases in neuroendocrine tumor patients. However, some major pitfalls in this work must be acknowledged. First and most importantly, there is no information about tumor characteristics (primary site, grading) and patient characteristics (e.g. performance status). Without this pieces of information critical confounders can not be accounted for and thus prevent the manuscript from being of interest in this reviewer opinion. Similarly, presence of extrahepatic disease should be reported and included in the analyses. Is there any available information about pattern of liver metastasis? For example, using classification reported by Frilling et al in ENETS guidelines More concerns are: - using this register, if a patient underwent multiple resections, would Authors be able to discriminate among them? Which and how surgery has been chosen - in how many patients was the 30-days outcome/reammission information available? Since only % are reported in some sentences, denominator should be specified.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No