

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 64270

Title: Robotic Transanal Total Mesorectal Excision: Is the future now?

Reviewer's code: 00009776

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Director, Professor, Senior Scientist, Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-14 04:07

Reviewer performed review: 2021-02-23 01:29

Review time: 8 Days and 21 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Page 4, 2nd paragraph: "During the last ?years, and due to the continuous improvement in the platforms, robotics gained popularity with promising expectancies. " I wonder if the word "last" is proper? 2. I think you had better put The "Hybrid taTME " part in TECHNIQUE BACKGROUND. 3. Table 1: I believe the last reference (Dr. Ye), they should have used STARport as their transanal interface device.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 64270

Title: Robotic Transanal Total Mesorectal Excision: Is the future now?

Reviewer's code: 03017544

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Research Associate, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-14 19:44

Reviewer performed review: 2021-02-28 21:24

Review time: 14 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments for WJGS 64270 The review entitled “Robotic Transanal Total Mesorectal Excision: Is the future now?” write by Juan Carlos Sebastián-Tomás et al, want to discuss the current status of robotic TaTME (R-TaTME), including technical aspects, short- and long-term outcomes, as well as the foreseeable future marked by the improvements on robotic platforms and real-time navigation. Despite the concepts might be interesting there are some points which need clarification. Minor points. 1. Please develop the concept cost, learning and benefit 2. Please study in deep intraoperative complications 3. Please develop the concept of staging indications 4. The authors should modify Introduction, very long and Discussion/Conclusion, very short

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 64270

Title: Robotic Transanal Total Mesorectal Excision: Is the future now?

Reviewer's code: 03548282

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-14 02:09

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-03 05:45

Review time: 17 Days and 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1.thank you very much for your invitation, this technology is very novel. 2.the manuscript describe the background, present significance of the study. 3.the discussion discuss the manuscript's scientific significance. 4.the figures and tables are sufficient and appropriately illustrative of the manuscript contents. 5.langugue polish may be useful for improving the quality of the manuscript.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 64270

Title: Robotic Transanal Total Mesorectal Excision: Is the future now?

Reviewer's code: 02916651

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-13

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-02-15 01:48

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-04 14:33

Review time: 17 Days and 12 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author reviewed 'the Robotic Transanal Total Mesorectal Excision: Is the future now?' and gave an overview to the field of using Da Vinci in transanal surgery especially on the pros and cons of this procedure. There are still some problems need to be clarified. 1. The experience of TATME and Robotic surgery for rectal cancer are limited, combination of these two technique now have even less support evidence, till now there's only a small group of patient underwent these kind of operation and without long term follow up, please give some more advice for the surgeon who want to start this technique. 2. There is little information about the patient who chosen for the surgery, please some detail information about the tumor of the patient, such as the size of the tumor, the distance from the anal verge.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 64270

Title: Robotic Transanal Total Mesorectal Excision: Is the future now?

Reviewer's code: 03017544

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Research Associate, Surgical Oncologist

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Italy

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-13

Reviewer chosen by: Man Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-24 08:27

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-24 08:51

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The responses to reviewer comments are enough.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Surgery

Manuscript NO: 64270

Title: Robotic Transanal Total Mesorectal Excision: Is the future now?

Reviewer's code: 03548282

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2021-02-13

Reviewer chosen by: Man Liu

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-03-25 07:00

Reviewer performed review: 2021-03-25 07:09

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Suggest to accept