

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6076

Title: IMMUNE RELATED MANIFESTATIONS IN CHRONIC HCV INFECTION

Reviewer code: 00068513

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-01 21:13

Date reviewed: 2013-10-12 11:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article reviewed the paper about HCV immune mediated syndromes, their prevalence, clinical manifestations and possible theories regarding their pathogenesis. The content is interesting and provide useful information for common clinicians. However, some limitations still exist in this article:

1. The description of clinical manifestations and related previous study is a little shallow, and need deep analyze.
2. Some obvious spelling mistakes exist in it, so the language need polishing.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6076

Title: IMMUNE RELATED MANIFESTATIONS IN CHRONIC HCV INFECTION

Reviewer code: 00039017

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-01 21:13

Date reviewed: 2013-10-26 16:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review about immune related manifestations in chronic HCV infection. It is well designed and it gives good informations. However, I think some figures need to be improved (Figure 1 and 2). Re-writing of this manuscript in correct English would be required (e.g. NEYROLOGICAL MANIFESTATIONS; NEUROLOGICAL MANIFESTATIONS).

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6076

Title: IMMUNE RELATED MANIFESTATIONS IN CHRONIC HCV INFECTION

Reviewer code: 02860540

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-01 21:13

Date reviewed: 2013-12-26 23:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written omniscprehensive review of immune related manifestations in chronic HCV infection. Until now, in literature there are not reviews comprehending all the immune related manifestations in chronic HCV infection. This paper is suitable for publication with minor remarks. Minor remarks: 1)"The result of the above" please change this sentence because it is not clear. 2)"Furthermore, patients with HCV-related MC may present with clinical syndromes from the CNS." please rewrite this sentence 3) "The above indicate that in chronic HCV", please rewrite without "the above" it doesn't read well. 4) please change "hematouria" in "hematuria"

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6076

Title: IMMUNE RELATED MANIFESTATIONS IN CHRONIC HCV INFECTION

Reviewer code: 02860775

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-01 21:13

Date reviewed: 2013-12-27 22:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting review, dealing with a timely topic, i.e. autoimmunity in chronic HCV infection, which is presented in a revised version, whereby some specific concerns have been addressed. In the present form, the review is well written, with a good balance among the different immune-related manifestations associated with HCV infection. The illustrations are well representative of the wide spectrum of these conditions. However, there are still some critical issues that must be carefully considered to improve the quality of the review: 1) The term “extrahepatic” must be included in the title (as underlined in the new sentence of the introduction), since the review does not refer to chronic hepatitis with autoimmune features, characterized by LKM+ autoantibodies, which is not rarely associated to chronic C infection. 2) The pathogenetic mechanisms linking autoreactivity to HCV infection must be outlined in the introduction, at least briefly, such as: a. The sequence homologies shared by the HCV antigens and "self" proteins (such as CYP2D6) (molecular mimicry mechanism); b. The HCV interaction with B lymphocytes leading to a polyclonal B cell activation (B cell stimulatory mechanism). 3) Figure 2 and Figure 4 are not quoted along the main text. 4) Page 8: the observation related to ref #25 is not clear, thus the sentence must be rephrased. 5) The frequent use of “the above indicate” is too redundant and somehow distracting. 6) A new table illustrating the variety of non organ specific autoreactivities in HCV infection with the related clinical significance can be of help for the general reader. 7) The therapeutic challenges when facing with a HCV-infected patient with autoimmune manifestations, must be properly outlined and discussed in the conclusions. This is still an unsolved issue the authors do not address thoroughly.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 6076

Title: IMMUNE RELATED MANIFESTATIONS IN CHRONIC HCV INFECTION

Reviewer code: 02860784

Science editor: Qi, Yuan

Date sent for review: 2013-10-01 21:13

Date reviewed: 2014-01-06 04:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

“Immune Related Manifestations in Chronic HCV Infection” written by Maria Tampaki and John Koskinas is a literature review covering the autoimmune diseases that are associated with chronic HCV infection and giving current hypotheses regarding the etiologies of these diseases. The review is generally well written and assembles worthwhile references about a clinically interesting topic. There are some minor language problems throughout the manuscript, and the manuscript would be strengthened with some minor English language editing. I suggest the following changes prior to publishing the review: Page 3 Line 2 of page 3 should say “130-170,000,000 people”, line 6 “patients approximately”, and “apart from liver disease”, line 8 should say which rather than “whom”, line 19 should read “consisting of only one monoclonal” Page 4 Line2 should be “inflammatory reactions”, line 5 “but” should be replaced by “and” or “but... manifestations in only 5-10% of them”, line 23 should be “100,000 person-years” and it would be useful to cite the occurrence of ITP in patients without HCV for comparison. Page 5 Line 1 should read “With respect to pathogenesis, the most...”, line 5 needs to have ANA defined before using abbreviations, Line 30 should be “small vessel vasculitis”, line 24 needs to define ANCA, Line 28 should say “the cause of larger vessel vasculitis” Page 8, line 17 should be “glomeruli” Page 9, line 28 should refer to citation 39, I believe.