

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 21349

**Title:** Application of the Prague C and M criteria for endoscopic description of columnar-lined esophagus in South Korea

**Reviewer's code:** 00503623

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-07-08 18:11

**Date reviewed:** 2015-07-11 01:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript, ESPS # 21349, describes the applicability of Prague C and M criteria for accurate diagnosis of Barrett's esophagus (BE) in Korean population. Total 231 cases with columnar-lined esophagus (CLE) were included and classified according to C and M criteria. Based on the obtained results, the authors suggest that because of different endoscopic features of CLE among the Korean population the C and M criteria require modifications. Although the paper is well presented, the presented data and conclusions are of limited value to the general readership (except Korea) of the Journal.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 21349

**Title:** Application of the Prague C and M criteria for endoscopic description of columnar-lined esophagus in South Korea

**Reviewer's code:** 00057695

**Reviewer's country:** Saudi Arabia

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2015-07-08 18:11

**Date reviewed:** 2015-08-12 12:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [ ] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This prospective study looks at the application of Prague C and M criteria in evaluating endoscopic columnar-lined esophagus in Korean patient. The conclusion is that due to the low prevalence of Barrett's esophagus (BE) in Korea, the Prague M and C criteria need to be modified to include detailed endoscopic description of the ultrashort- and short-segment BE, which are the most dominant BE types in Korea and also to account for the presence of columnar islands which is a frequent finding in Korean patients. The study is has clear defined inclusion and exclusion criteria and is well conducted despite the lack of a control group. I think this study is innovative and would be interesting to see if the findings are reproducible in other countries where BE is not as common as in the West.