



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 21349

Title: Application of the Prague C and M criteria for endoscopic description of columnar-lined esophagus in South Korea

Reviewer's code: 00503623

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-08 18:11

Date reviewed: 2015-07-11 01:43

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript, ESPS # 21349, describes the applicability of Prague C and M criteria for accurate diagnosis of Barrett's esophagus (BE) in Korean population. Total 231 cases with columnar-lined esophagus (CLE) were included and classified according to C and M criteria. Based on the obtained results, the authors suggest that because of different endoscopic features of CLE among the Korean population the C and M criteria require modifications. Although the paper is well presented, the presented data and conclusions are of limited value to the general readership (except Korea) of the Journal.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastrointestinal Endoscopy

ESPS manuscript NO: 21349

Title: Application of the Prague C and M criteria for endoscopic description of columnar-lined esophagus in South Korea

Reviewer's code: 00057695

Reviewer's country: Saudi Arabia

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-08 18:11

Date reviewed: 2015-08-12 12:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This prospective study looks at the application of Prague C and M criteria in evaluating endoscopic columnar-lined esophagus in Korean patient. The conclusion is that due to the low prevalence of Barrett's esophagus (BE) in Korea, the Prague M and C criteria need to be modified to include detailed endoscopic description of the ultrashort- and short-segment BE, which are the most dominant BE types in Korea and also to account for the presence of columnar islands which is a frequent finding in Korean patients. The study is has clear defined inclusion and exclusion criteria and is well conducted despite the lack of a control group. I think this study is innovative and would be interesting to see if the findings are reproducible in other countries where BE is not as common as in the West.