

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7317

Title: Host RNA circles and an examination of their relevance to the origin and replication of hepatitis delta virus

Reviewer code: 01809067

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-13 17:38

Date reviewed: 2013-11-19 15:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

excellent review need some figures in order to elucidate the mechanism of rna circles and hcv replication

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7317

Title: Host RNA circles and an examination of their relevance to the origin and replication of hepatitis delta virus

Reviewer code: 00504365

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-13 17:38

Date reviewed: 2013-11-19 16:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Taylor JM represents a very interesting and updated review on HDV replication. The author raises a number of important issues and hypothesis that overall open new perspectives and directions on HDV research. The review is well written and may be published in the present form provided some minor corrections are made: 1 - References number 3 - 13, 22, and 30 need to be corrected by including the year of publication 2 - On page 9, the last sentence of the 1st paragraph needs a reference: " One recent study confirmed the stability of the host RNA circle relative to other linear species." 3 - Some language polishing is suggested: Page 2, lanes 3, 21, and 23 Page 3, lanes 12, 15, and 26 Page 7, lanes 9 and 18 4 - I suggest to include a simple figure illustrating the proposed mechanism of HDV RNA replication.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7317

Title: Host RNA circles and an examination of their relevance to the origin and replication of hepatitis delta virus

Reviewer code: 00503937

Science editor: Gou, Su-Xin

Date sent for review: 2013-11-13 17:38

Date reviewed: 2013-11-25 16:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is well organized and written. The literature survey is up to date either. It is indeed a very nice review. However, some minor errors in the references shall be corrected. Several publication years are missing in the references (e.g. 3, 4, 5...). In addition, it would be very helpful for the readers to understand the mechanism if the author can provide some figures.