

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26929

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 03478516

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-05-04 14:40

Date reviewed: 2016-05-08 23:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To give readers a wider perspective about the topic, mainly to those ones outside this specific interest, Authors should emphasize the link between MS and HCC via NAFLD, referring to.....Could metabolic syndrome lead to hepatocarcinoma via non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. World J Gastroenterol. 2014 Jul 28;20(28):9217-28

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26929

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02860874

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-05-04 14:40

Date reviewed: 2016-06-14 11:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting review article about the mechanisms involved in the development of HCC in NAFLD, it explores clearly the genetic, immunological and pathophysiological mechanisms related to NAFLD and HCC

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26929

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 01490291

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-05-04 14:40

Date reviewed: 2016-06-24 02:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Wong et al present review on the hot topic of HCC complication in patients suffering from NAFLD. before publication I would recommend just few suggestions . 1 section . "Curative treatment and outcomes" suggest also to bring the Italian experience reported by Piscaglia et al, experience already mentioned in the previous section(ref 27) 2-also in the finals section entitled by Authors as "future directions "it lacks a reference to the problem of the need of surveillance programs for HCC in populations at risk. Today is a good bet that can not be neglected as an open problem 3- on this field I suggest to add a comment (see also Sasdelli AM and Marchesini G ; Curr Hepatology Rep DOI 10.1007 / s11901-016-0297

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 26929

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma in patients with non-alcoholic fatty liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00006258

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-05-04 14:40

Date reviewed: 2016-07-01 23:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript constitutes a review of the pathophysiology and treatment of HCC in the context of NAFLD. Whilst other reviews of a similar nature exist, it is likely to be of interest to the readership of WJG. It is reasonably comprehensive, but written in a rather list like style that would maybe benefit from some contextualizing to make it more readable for a wider hepatology audience. In particular the review would be improved by addition of schematic diagrams to summarise pathogenic mechanisms and to make clear distinction between those which operate on a background of cirrhosis vs the non-cirrhotic cases. At present the mechanism section is lacking depth as evidenced by the limited discussion of roles of the immune system in development. Similarly the contribution of hepatic progenitor cell populations should be discussed. Minor comments Some typos eg 'vital' hepatitis pg 1 last paragraph Editing comments still visible on submitted version