

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 51349

Title: Clinical characteristics and treatment outcomes in patients with liver cirrhosis and lymphoma

Reviewer's code: 00030603

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's country: Greece

Author's country: Mexico

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-10 16:42

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-14 13:32

Review time: 3 Days and 20 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

This is an interesting study about chemotherapy of lymphomas in cirrhotic patients. There are not many informations about this. Were the HCV viremic cirrhotics treated for the viral infection along the chemotherapy or after the end of this? This would be very interesting to be mentioned.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 51349

Title: Clinical characteristics and treatment outcomes in patients with liver cirrhosis and lymphoma

Reviewer's code: 02447091

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Assistant Professor, Doctor

Reviewer's country: Japan

Author's country: Mexico

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-13 07:35

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-17 23:34

Review time: 4 Days and 15 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Gonzalez-Regueiro JA et al attempted to reveal clinical characteristics and treatment outcomes in patients with liver cirrhosis and lymphoma and found in this manuscript that it was possible to administer chemotherapy in cirrhotic patients, regardless of their severity, obtaining satisfactory clinical outcomes. English writing is fair (few grammatical error) and this work is worth enough for possible publication in WJH. Major comments. 1. Please explain or even speculate the reason why the incidence of H. pylori infection is significantly higher in lymphoma with liver cirrhosis compared to lymphoma without it. Minor comments. 1. Provide page number in the manuscript. 2. Page 6, lines 21. It is well know ... is It is well known ... 3. Table 3, lines 8. The cases of Hodgkin lymphoma in controls are 2 (10%) instead of 2 (20%) since the total number of controls are 20.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 51349

Title: Clinical characteristics and treatment outcomes in patients with liver cirrhosis and lymphoma

Reviewer's code: 01805500

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: CCST, MD

Professional title: Adjunct Professor, Research Scientist, Senior Scientist, Teacher

Reviewer's country: Italy

Author's country: Mexico

Reviewer chosen by: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-12 15:33

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-18 08:11

Review time: 5 Days and 16 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors constantly refer to C-P classification without giving further details. To better appreciate the importance of the decompensation of the studied patients, key point, Authors are warmly requested to refer to a modern classification as that presented in both...What are the implications of the spontaneous spleno-renal shunts in liver cirrhosis? BMC Gastroenterol. 2009 Nov 24;9:89....and..... Blood ammonia levels in liver cirrhosis: a clue for the presence of portosystemic collateral veins.BMC Gastroenterol. 2009 Mar 17;9:21. Deepening this aspect makes it clear what was the class to which belonged the patients (appropriate Table) and skips the doubts about the value of the median C-P score that is 7.5 (low for a decompensation) and explain in this way why the patients were classified as decompensated (80%).

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Hepatology

Manuscript NO: 51349

Title: Clinical characteristics and treatment outcomes in patients with liver cirrhosis and lymphoma

Reviewer's code: 00036801

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Doctor

Reviewer's country: Spain

Author's country: Mexico

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-09-12 06:49

Reviewer performed review: 2019-09-23 17:42

Review time: 11 Days and 10 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is about a case-control study in patients with cirrhosis and lymphoma treated with chemotherapy. This is an interesting and well written manuscript about a clinical situation barely treated in the literature. The retrospective nature of the study and the number of patients imply important limitations as the authors state but other limitations and bias risks have not been considered and them must be take in account before value the results. -Concretely, the selection bias (data are from patients treated out of guidelines recommendations at the time. So, a selection of patients can not be excluded) neither an immortal time bias by which selected patients were more prone to survive and to respond to chemotherapy. Authors must analyze both bias and discuss its possible influence in the results. It would be very interesting to compare survival and adverse events appearance between the case group and a control group formed by paired patients with cirrhosis and lymphoma non-treated with chemotherapy. - It is important that authors define in the text accurately the minimum and maximum time difference between cirrhosis and lymphoma diagnosis to consider them as concomitant diagnosis. - In the "Characteristics of lymphoma in the population" section authors state that "the predominant histologic subtype was diffuse large B cell (80%) in 24 patients". This figure must be wrong. - A detailed description of number and severity of infection cases in both groups must be included in the text. There were significant differences in the number of infections between groups? - In the discussion section, categorical statements such as "these patients have risk factors related to both the development of cirrhosis (such as HCV infection) and disease per se (alterations in immune surveillance), which confers an increased risk of developing neoplastic diseases, including lymphomas" must be supported by references. - The conclusion paragraph should be more prudent and consider the numerous limitations and bias of the study.



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No