

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Pharmacology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14199

Title: Antimicrobial resistance in clinically important biofilms

Reviewer code: 00465176

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-09-24 17:26

Date reviewed: 2014-09-26 06:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is detailed but it is unclear what is the novelty and addition to the literature since numerous other reviews have been reported on this topic. In addition the organization of the text throughout the manuscript is difficult to follow, lacks good flow since similar themes are mentioned randomly throughout the manuscript rather than in separate sections (e.g Pseudomonas biofilms, staph biofilms). The text can be shortened significantly and replaced by summary tables and figures as follows Summary tables summarizing the differences in biofilms a) between different organisms (e.g Staphylococcus versus pseudomonas vs other organisms) b) between in vitro formed vs in vivo formed biofilms should be presented. c) Differences between biofilm forming bacteria vs free living bacteria d) Summary of all the known virulence mechanisms of biofilm forming bacteria e.g specific names for PSA versus Staph rather than reporting them throughout the text Figures showing 1) Pathogenesis of biofilm formation 2) Mechanisms of resistance to antibiotics 3) Mechanisms of persisters The text can be better organized. For example CF is mentioned throughout the manuscript at different sections and the text can be organized in certain sections per bacteria (e.g staphylococci) or per disease (pseudomonas and CF). In addition there is no mention of antibiotics and treatment for biofilms for example daptomycin , rifampin etc. Maybe a table can be added to emphasize this important topic. Spell out all abbreviations e.g TCA cycle

ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Pharmacology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14199

Title: Antimicrobial resistance in clinically important biofilms

Reviewer code: 00506590

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2014-09-24 17:26

Date reviewed: 2014-10-08 03:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> [] Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> [] Existing	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> [] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review is of superb quality and it will contribute importantly the area of microbial pathogenesis. The only topic that is missed and I strongly suggest to be included is amyloid bacterial proteins and their role in the biofilm formation and in antimicrobial resistance phenomena.