

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Virology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14872

Title: Insights into HIV-HBV co-infection in India

Reviewer's code: 00504121

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-31 08:26

Date reviewed: 2014-11-24 19:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review article is a good blend of information available from India as well as from other parts of the globe. 1. Thorough revision with respect to language usage and grammar is required before considering the manuscript for acceptance. 2. The Table.1 seems not necessary. The information that many aspects of this clinical feature is not available from India may also be mentioned in the text. 3. Figure. 1 is not comprehensible. The authors need to make the figure and legends more clear to correctly represent their point of view.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Virology

ESPS manuscript NO: 14872

Title: Insights into HIV-HBV co-infection in India

Reviewer's code: 00504271

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Mei Gong

Date sent for review: 2014-10-31 08:26

Date reviewed: 2014-11-25 07:49

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review article by Chakravarty and Pal is well-written and should be published after properly modified. The authors collected the numbers of publications from India and other world (Table). It is advised to summarize the genotypes and mutations of HBV in the HIV-HBV co-infection cases in India in a table or map. Some sentences which may mislead the audience should be revised properly.

1. P.3, l. 14: "As a consequence in an estimated 40 million people living with HIV worldwide, 90% show the biological signs of prior HBV infection." According to ref. 2, the incidence of HBV-prior infection (90 %) was estimated in Southeast Asia and sub-Saharan Africa. This sentence should be corrected properly.
2. P. 6, l. 25- p. 7, l. 1: The authors mislead the paper by Thio et al (ref. 25). In their abstract, "In settings where HBV DNA is not available, HBeAg may be useful to assess the need for HBV treatment." is mentioned.
3. P.8, l. 2-4: "Again, in the recent report on a multi-national HIV infected cohort (n=113) Thio et al. found predominance of HBV/A (72%) and HBV/D (16%) in HIV-HBV co-infection worldwide[25]." The authors should mention that the geographical divergence of HBV genotypes was also stressed in ref. 25.

Minor point 1. P. 9, l. 8: "x ORF" should be "X ORF."