

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15500

Title: Liver fat deposition and mitochondrial dysfunction in morbid obesity: an approach combining metabolomics with liver imaging and histology

Reviewer's code: 00182548

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-28 10:55

Date reviewed: 2014-12-24 00:05

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article is very interesting and well written. The methodology and results are presented in detail, rigorous. Although the number of patients is small, the authors obtained statistically significant results. The authors must add DOI at some references. Starting from the obtained results, it would be useful that the authors add some directions for future research. The article is useful for practitioners and researchers. I think that it deserves to be published.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15500

Title: Liver fat deposition and mitochondrial dysfunction in morbid obesity: an approach combining metabolomics with liver imaging and histology

Reviewer's code: 00043980

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-28 10:55

Date reviewed: 2014-12-24 01:01

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|--|---|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

We have reviewed this manuscript. Questions for the Authors: 1) The authors do not mention the limitations of the study. Most glaring would be the low number of patients included in the final analysis. 2) Grammatical Errors: Page 3, lines 11-14: run-on sentence, consider revising Page 4, line 23: consider removing "a" from "to achieve with a simple" Page 5, line 31: consider removing "a" from "to obtain a 100%" Page 12, line 15: change "RMS" to MRS Pages 13-14 (lines 32 of page 13 to lines 1-3 of page 14): run-on sentence, consider revising

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 15500

Title: Liver fat deposition and mitochondrial dysfunction in morbid obesity: an approach combining metabolomics with liver imaging and histology

Reviewer's code: 00071652

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2014-11-28 10:55

Date reviewed: 2014-12-11 22:38

| CLASSIFICATION | LANGUAGE EVALUATION | SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT | CONCLUSION |
|---|--|--|--|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing | PubMed Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor | | BPG Search: | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> The same title | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication | |
| | | <input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism | |
| | | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No | |

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

this is a good study which evaluated the efficacy of MRI imaging in NAFLD . you performed liver biopsy before and after surgery. How did you evaluate liver biopsy? Fibrosis score ? Etc.. Did you use Brunt classification ? you wrote only steatosis percent in the text. you should detail the liver biopsy and correlation with the MRI findings.