



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 39063

**Title:** Between evidence and new perspective in the actual state of the multimodal approach of gastric cancer: is there still a role for radiation therapy?

**Reviewer's code:** 02522214

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-03-30

**Date reviewed:** 2018-04-11

**Review time:** 12 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major comment: The overall manuscript will greatly benefit from a more in depth discussion of how evolution of radiation techniques, e.g. from historical 2 field to IMRT, has or could potentially impact perioperative/adjuvant/neoadjuvant therapy for

gastroesophageal cancer. Currently, this is only covered at a very superficial level in the manuscript. Minor comments: The full manuscript for the CRITICS trial was recently published and should be included for its relevance to this review for completeness. On page 3 for the statement "... despite the reported high rates of severe toxicities probably due to the old conventional . . ." should add high incidence of toxicities is also likely accounted for by the older high dose bolus schedule of 5-FU that was implemented and no longer recommended in treatment guidelines such as NCCN. On page 9 for the statement "... use of DCF regimen, less aggressive when compared to other CT regimens . . ." should clarify that DCF in itself is a regimen typically associated with higher chemotherapy intensity and toxicity, but the particular modifications of DCF employed by Liu et al. was dose attenuated. On page 9 for the statement "... S-1 has been administered concomitantly to RT, alone [45-47] or in combination with cisplatin, both in preoperative and postoperative setting . . ." should comment that the ARTIST II trial appears to be using S-1 as the concurrent chemotherapy agent during radiation.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242

**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243

**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

**https://** [www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

[Y] No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,  
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**Fax:** +1-925-223-8243  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://** www.wjgnet.com

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 39063

**Title:** Between evidence and new perspective in the actual state of the multimodal approach of gastric cancer: is there still a role for radiation therapy?

**Reviewer's code:** 02687374

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-04-10

**Date reviewed:** 2018-04-16

**Review time:** 6 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

### SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This review introduced recent updates from randomized data and prospective phase I/II trial regarding the role of radiotherapy in the multimodal approach of gastric cancer. According to the author's description, I learned that radiation therapy acting on locally

advanced disease played an effective role as many evidence shown. In general, evidences of updates of combined therapy, novel chemotherapeutic regimens and modern radiotherapy techniques were collected and introduced comprehensively, in which the role of radiation therapy were described. The set of evidences presented look convincing, solid and support the conclusions drawn. But there were some mistakes in English expression, grammar.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 39063

**Title:** Between evidence and new perspective in the actual state of the multimodal approach of gastric cancer: is there still a role for radiation therapy?

**Reviewer's code:** 03261241

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-04-10

**Date reviewed:** 2018-04-23

**Review time:** 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper by Linda Agolli and Luca Nicosia entitled 'Between evidence and new perspective in the actual state of the multimodal approach of gastric cancer: is there still a role for radiation therapy?' is a review that summarized the efficiency of systematic

therapy to improve the prognosis of gastric cancer (GC). The authors described the possibility of advantage of peri-operative radiation therapy for local advanced GC. The article will be of interest to readers of this journal. To take priority for publication, however, the manuscript should be revised. Comments: 1. The paper is required to conform to correct English and could benefit from editorial language help. 2. The authors should mention laparoscopic gastrectomy for local advanced GC with or without peri-operative CT or CRT. 3. The authors should provide what is the optimal timing of the conversion to surgery after CT or CRT. 4. The authors should describe the treatment in the case of recurrence.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastrointestinal Oncology

**Manuscript NO:** 39063

**Title:** Between evidence and new perspective in the actual state of the multimodal approach of gastric cancer: is there still a role for radiation therapy?

**Reviewer's code:** 02546253

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Fang-Fang Ji

**Date sent for review:** 2018-04-10

**Date reviewed:** 2018-04-25

**Review time:** 14 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript by Linda Agolli and Luca Nicosia presents data on the systematic therapy for gastric cancer. Even though the strategy of gastric cancer, especially in advanced cancer, remains controversial, their manuscript is coherent and, the



conclusions were reasonable.

## INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

### *Google Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

### *BPG Search:*

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No