

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 31743

Title: Dementia and osteoporosis in a geriatric population: Is there a common link?

Reviewer's code: 02528832

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-12-06 15:13

Date reviewed: 2016-12-17 16:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study, and what is reviewed is well done, although the subject is more complex, possibly with the interplay of several more hormones and/or cytokines involved, such as myokines, neurotrophic factors, IGF-1, fibroblast growth factors, etc. As the authors correctly state in the discussion, the finding of an altered levels of a certain molecule (hormone, cytokine,...)both in dementia and osteoporosis does not necessarily imply a pathogenetic relationship. I would not include in this review factors such as alcohol or statins, or many other products consumed by the elderly (for instance tobacco, etc.), and perhaps it would be appropriate to expand the information derived from mediators secreted by bone cells. osteocyte/osteobdeepen

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 31743

Title: Dementia and osteoporosis in a geriatric population: Is there a common link?

Reviewer's code: 02699714

Reviewer's country: South Korea

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-12-06 15:13

Date reviewed: 2016-12-17 19:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Title: Dementia and osteoporosis in a geriatric population: Is there a common link? General comments: The manuscript investigates the association of dementia and osteoporosis whether common pathogenesis exist in two different diseases. The authors tried their best to elucidate the common etiologic factor with all efforts. As authors stated there is a possibility of the reverse causality between vitamin D and dementia. And it is also quite possible that these associations are coincidental and not related to a common aetiological factor. However, the manuscript is interesting and very well-written. Although this review did not elucidate the exact common pathway between dementia and osteoporosis, would suggest an understanding molecular basis and factors to be studied in further clinical trials. The two thing I would bring up. 1. The most compelling evidence that authors found were APOE4 allele and amyloid beta peptides. Am I right? If so, I would suggest the summarization regarding these things as a key factors of common etiologic factor in Discussion. 2. Page 7, third paragraph 'Alternatively, dementia and vitamin K deficiency may share a common cause ~' what is 'hepatic receptor'? Even if the points that I have raised are not answered I think that this paper is worth accepting but I think these considerations would make it a better paper.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Orthopedics

ESPS manuscript NO: 31743

Title: Dementia and osteoporosis in a geriatric population: Is there a common link?

Reviewer's code: 00742086

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-12-06 15:13

Date reviewed: 2016-12-19 11:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dementia and osteoporosis are quite common diseases and cause significant morbidity and mortality in our aging society. The author aims at description of common link between the two diseases. In the current manuscript, author describes several factors related with dementia or/and osteoporosis. It is quite meaningful if we could have a clear perspective on the correlation of two diseases. However, several issues should be addressed. 1.The author describes in the most cases the linkage of each factor with dementia OR osteoporosis, while the evidences the direct relationship between each factor and both diseases as an entirety is more important. 2.As a review, the recent literatures are quite important, the author should more clearly state them, such as (1) Amouzougan, Adamah; Lafaie, Ludovic; Marotte, Hubert; et al., High prevalence of dementia in women with osteoporosis. Joint, bone, spine : revue du rhumatisme, 2016-Sep-30; (2) Mughal, Noreen; Inderjeeth, Charles A., Residential status decline and increased mortality - a consequence of under-treatment of osteoporosis in patients with dementia. Findings from an ortho-geriatric unit. Australasian Journal on Ageing, 2015, 34(SI-1), 57-58; (3) Westerman, Perry; Cogbill, Elizabeth, American Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry, 2015, 23(3), S29-S30; (4) Chang, Kuang-Hsi; Chung, Chi-Jung; Lin, Cheng-Li; et. Al.,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Increased risk of dementia in patients with osteoporosis: a population-based retrospective cohort analysis. Age 2014, 36(2), 967-975; (5) Knopp-Sihota, Jennifer A.; Cummings, Greta G.; Newburn-Cook, Christine V.; et al., Dementia diagnosis and osteoporosis treatment propensity: A population-based nested case-control study. Geriatrics & Gerontology International, 2014, 14(1),121-129 and so on.