Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 5389
Title: FDG-PET INITIAL STAGING IN HODGKIN LYMPHOMA PATIENTS HAS IMPACT ON 5-YEARS OVERALL AND EVENT FREE SURVIVAL.
Reviewer code: 00289563
Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan
Date sent for review: 2013-09-09 16:43
Date reviewed: 2013-10-07 11:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	BPG Search:	[ ] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)		[ ] Existed	[Y] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS
This study looked into the prognostic effect of staging with PET scans. it yielded some interesting findings. The difference in PFS and OS observed with two different staging systems may be explained by the fact that PET scan is more accurate in staging. Therefore, some of the early stages as determined by CT scan are upstaged to more advanced stages. The authors claimed that the PET and CT scans were performed no longer than two weeks apart. Therefore, the autors should reveal how many cases of early HL as determined by CT scan were upgraded to advanced stages and how many cases of advanced stages were downgraded to early stages. In addition, to support the authors' conclusion that PET staging is the most important prognostic factor, the authors should provide the OS, PFS, Kaplan-meyer curves and statistical analysis of the early and advanced stage patients of the same population (117 patients) based on Ct and PET scans.

Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited
Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road,
Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Radiology
ESPS Manuscript NO: 5389
Title: FDG-PET INITIAL STAGING IN HODGKIN LYMPHOMA PATIENTS HAS IMPACT ON 5-YEARS OVERALL AND EVENT FREE SURVIVAL.
Reviewer code: 00227360
Science editor: Ma, Ya-Juan
Date sent for review: 2013-09-09 16:43
Date reviewed: 2013-10-08 12:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[Y] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[ ] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The author reported the prognostic value and risk classification improvement of using metabolic staging (MS) with FDG-PET in initial staging of Hodgkin's Lymphoma (HL) patients to predict 5y overall survival (OS) and event free survival (EFS), compared to conventional staging with CT. The conclusion is that initial staging of FDG-PET in HL is an accurate and independent predictor of OS and EFS. The manuscript is well organized and nicely presented. In "Staging by FDG-PET (Era 2) , M&M section ", the author said that both CT and PET imaging were acquired consecutively. However, it is not very clear what is the role of CT here, any contrast agent is given? And what's the difference of CT between Era1 and Era2? Besides, for the easy of readers, the "Ann Arbor staging system" should also be briefly explained in the text.