

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16829

Title: Changes in gene expression in liver tissue from patients with fulminant hepatitis E

Reviewer's code: 03222928

Reviewer's country: Switzerland

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-30 17:22

Date reviewed: 2015-02-06 00:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper offers interesting data regarding the pathogenesis of fulminant hepatitis E, in order to better characterise the immune-mediated killing of infected cells. It is well written and results are convincing. It would be of interest to explain why the authors included a control group with fulminant hepatitis B and not other virus (for example HAV, which, indeed, share more of the pathogenesis mechanisms of infection with HEV than HBV). If available, I would also provide the viremia (HBV DNA and HEV RNA values) of patients in both groups (fulminant B and E hepatitis). Other clinical information would also be interesting: days from clinical onset to death, other liver enzymes, etc). Although numbers are very small, it would be desirable to include in table 1 a column with the p values comparing patients with fulminant hepatitis B and hepatitis E.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16829

Title: Changes in gene expression in liver tissue from patients with fulminant hepatitis E

Reviewer's code: 02521203

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-30 17:22

Date reviewed: 2015-01-31 11:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting study performed by Naik et al, the author have investigated the gene expression and immune cells in the liver tissues from Fulminant Hepatitis E and healthy control. The study is carefully designed and executed, appropriate controls are included, the references are up to date and limitations of the study are discussed. Specific comments: 1. A paragraph describing the statistical analysis/software is missing in the methods section. 2. In the results section, author stated that the fold change in selected genes was further validated, however the data is not to be found. Please indicate clearly. 3. Have the authors tried to valid overexpressed gene candidates in HEV samples with IHC? 4. Please explain the significance to include the HBV group?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 16829

Title: Changes in gene expression in liver tissue from patients with fulminant hepatitis E

Reviewer's code: 03197240

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2015-01-30 17:22

Date reviewed: 2015-02-01 20:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	PubMed Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Minor comments: 1. Page 8, 2.6 Materials and Methods section It was stated "Formalin-fixed, paraffin-embedded liver sections were stained with hematoxylin and eosin, and examined to confirm the presence of acute inflammation in patients with FH, and absence of disease in controls". authors should provide specific pathological character of acute inflammation observed under HE stain. 2. Page 10, Results section, first paragraph need revise, should not start with a table title. 3. page 11, results section, 3.3.2. the found of genes differentially expressed in FH-E need detailed description, though these results also can be checked in table 3. 4. Discussion section. should focus more on the novel observations and should put the results, also the discussion does not include enough about the meaning of the results.